ULUSLARARASI ÖĞRENCİ SEMPOZYUMU

International Student Symposium

SİYASAL BİLGİLER ve SOSYOLOJİ

BİLDİRİLER KİTABI

8

PROCEEDINGS BOOK
POLITICAL SCIENCE and SOCIOLOGY

ULUSLARARASI
ÖĞRENCİ
SEMPOZYUMU
International Student Symposium

23-25
EYLÜL
20
22

KAHRAMANMARAŞ
SÜTÇÜ İMAM ÜNİVERSİTESİ

8. ULUSLARARASI ÖĞRENCİ SEMPOZYUMU
BİLDİRİLER KİTABI - 8
8th INTERNATIONAL STUDENT SYMPOSIUM
PROCEEDINGS BOOK – 8

SİYASAL BİLGİLER VE SOSYOLOJİ
POLITICAL SCIENCE AND SOCIOLOGY

Editör / Editor

Azamat Arpachiev

Tasarım / Graphic Design

Cüret KARAKAŞ

UDEF

İÇİNDEKİLER

The Employment Practices of Filipino Household Workers in Türkiye

Abdulhamid Gunda[1]

Abstract

This phenomenological study aimed to explore the experiences of migrant Filipino Household Workers in Türkiye in the context of employment practices. In-depth Interviews was utilized to gather the primary data for this qualitative research. Specifically, eighteen (18) Filipino household workers who were selected through a snowball sampling method have given their consent and participated to the study. Depending on the preferences of the participants, the interviews were conducted online and face-to-face. Moreover, thematic analysis inclusive of transcriptions, coding, themes creation and analysis was used for the data analyses. The study revealed the experiences of Filipino household Workers in Turkiye in terms of their employment practices and some aspects of their working conditions. Specifically, the thematic analysis revealed main themes that correspond to the workers' employment practices such as pre-employment practices, job search practices and the use of formal employment practices. Furthermore, working condition issues raised by the workers are summed up into main themes such as vague job descriptions, long working hours, remuneration issues and common causes of argument with employers. These findings of the study are significant in terms of its potential contribution to policy development in migrant domestic services particularly in terms of labor market access and employment practices for migrant domestic workers. Furthermore, it can contribute to the knowledge base of social work education and practice. Migrants and domestic workers are identified in social work as vulnerable and to some extent, disadvantaged. Therefore, it is a mandate of the profession to protect and promote their well-being through scientific research such as this work in order to advance policies and advocacies beneficial to this vulnerable group.

Keywords: Social Work, Employment Practices, Working Conditions, Migrant Worker, Domestic Work

---

[1] PhD Candidate at İstanbul Sabahattin Zaim University, Institute of Graduate Studies, Department of Social Work

Introduction

Undervalued and underpaid are two words that can best describe the current status of domestic work worldwide. Despite the vital role of domestic workers in the care and welfare of millions of households, the domestic sector is still poorly regulated. The United Nations' International Labor Organization (ILO) has distinguished the sector to be gendered as it is dominated by female breadwinners who often belong to groups that are demographically disadvantaged both in the labor market and in social policy. Such characteristics make the migrant household workers susceptible to exploitative working and employment conditions.

In the Philippines, women dominate the domestic work both locally and overseas. About one-quarter of Philippine workers deployed overseas every year enter domestic service. Concern for their safety and protection from abuse is particularly strong especially in the aftermath of the execution of Flor Contemplacion, a Philippine domestic worker in Singapore in 1995 Sayres N.J. (2005). Similar tragic stories of some Filipino domestic workers have been tackled in some news articles and have caught public attention. In 2015, Annie Kelly and Hazel Thompson of The Guardian have addressed the issue involving Filipino household domestic workers, Marilyn and Terril. Marilyn's family was informed of her death after one long year of searching. Terril on the other hand had been reported to have tried committing suicide and succeeded at the second attempt. With the current status of labor and employment practices in domestic work, Marilyn and Terril are not going to be the last Filipinas who would leave and never come back. In 2018, Joana Demafelis was found dead with her remains stuffed in a freezer in Kuwait.

The migration of Filipino workers, popularly known as Overseas Filipino workers (OFWs[2]), began in 1974 after a labor law that allows export of workers overseas has been implemented. This was motivated by the country's effort to stabilize the economy which has been affected by the oil crisis. OFWs are currently being employed in around 200 countries. Oil-rich Middle East countries like the UAE, Saudi Arabia, Qatar and Kuwait are the usual first choice of destinations. Other countries popular among OFWs include Hongkong, Singapore, South Korea, The UK, Canada and the USA.

Compared to the above-mentioned countries, Turkiye was not a popular destination among

---

[2] Refers to the collective of Filipinos employed overseas

OFWs. The main reason for this is the lack of bilateral labor agreement between the Philippines and Turkiye. However, this does not stop Filipinas to consider Turkiye as either a country of destination or a transit country to Europe. At the moment, there is no existing official statistical data in regards to the total number of Filipino household workers in Turkiye. However, The Filipino Community in Turkiye (FCT) estimates over a thousand household workers in Istanbul. Based on their legal status, these workers can be grouped into three categories: resident, contractual and undocumented. The heterogeneity in the legal status of these Filipino household workers imply complexity in their labor and employment practices.

The situations like the current status of domestic work globally, the tragic stories and employment issues involving Filipino women domestic workers in different countries, the lack of bilateral agreement for labor force between the Philippines and Türkiye, make this research subject highly significant as it covers issues that are socially relevant at both micro and macro level.

Despite the decent work deficit, household work, widely known as domestic work, possesses both economic and social value. The sending and the host countries benefit from the economic value of this sector which is generated through employment opportunities, increased personal income, tax revenues and the remittances send from the country of destinations to sending countries. On the other hand, the social value of domestic work benefits both the sending and host countries in terms of the promotion of gender equity, women empowerment, and poverty alleviation which are all considered as serious social problems. Significantly, promoting decent work for domestic or household workers plays a significant role in achieving Millennium Development Goals such as a) the eradication of extreme poverty and hunger and b) promotion of gender equality and empowerment of women.

The presence of household workers does not only reduce the time and other related pressures for households but also increase participation of women in the labor force. This makes the equilibrium between work and family possible. From the side of the domestic workers, the remuneration and other monetary benefits they earn allow them to provide financial assistance to their own household back home. This, if performed fairly through decent employment practice, will lead to poverty reduction and women's empowerment.

Considering the socio-economic values of domestic work, this proposed research study is

highly significant in terms of its potential contribution to a) filling information or research gaps in the discourse on employment relationship in domestic work in general and the employment practices and working conditions of the Filipino Household Workers in Türkiye in particular and b) promoting decent work for domestic workers through enhanced and comprehensive social policy and legal measures both in the sending and host countries.

Based on the review of related literature and studies, there exists information gaps on the working and living conditions of household workers and the state of employment relationship between domestic workers and their employers. Most researchers have tackled cases of abuse and violence against domestic workers. Several country-based labor force surveys focused on working hours and wages. Moreover, while most empirical studies addressed issues such as payment, working hours and nature of contract, only very few have addressed occupational safety and health and the recruitment processes. Currently, none has addressed the whole scope of employment relationship between the household worker and employment in terms of issues such as contractual arrangements, organization and boundaries of tasks, interpersonal relations and attitude of workers and employers towards each other. In line with these, this research work which aimed to explore the employment practices and working conditions of the Filipino Household Workers in Turkiye, contains relevant data which can be utilized to generate a more comprehensive research design to fill the gaps in the employment relationship in domestic work. Therefore, by filling this gap, this study will provide further insight into the employee's perception of the working conditions and employment practices in domestic work. This will provide significant information which can help facilitate the design of empowerment-based interventions aimed at preventing and reducing risks to forced labour and trafficking of household workers. Thus, improving employment relationships and promoting decent work for domestic workers.

Finally, one of the most pressing issues concerning the Filipino Household Workers in Turkiye in their quest for decent work from the macro level is the absence of a bilateral labour agreement between Turkiye and The Philippines. Therefore, this exploratory study on the employment practices and working conditions of Filipino Household Workers in Turkiye is highly significant when it comes to provision of baseline data necessary for the realization of such important policy in the form of a bilateral agreement. Moreover, from the lens of Social Work as a profession and a discipline which champions human rights advocacy and as a catalyst of

9

social policy, this research study which aims to broaden the awareness and understanding of the situation of household workers is significant, in aid of legislation, to the pursuit of comprehensive measures aimed to promote the well-being and the welfare of the Filipino Household Workers in Türkiye through a) promotion and protection of their rights through legal and policy reform, b) empowerment of domestic workers, c) capacity building to the governments and employers for them to improve approaches towards protecting the rights of household workers, and d) providing mechanisms to protect the household workers from trafficking and forced labor.

Theoretical Framework

Domestic work or domestic labor is one of the oldest sectors that employs millions of people all around the world (Gunda, 2021). As cited in Gunda (2021), the International Labor Organization (ILO) briefly defined the term domestic labor as "works performed in or for a household or households" and the term domestic worker in reference to "any person engaged in domestic work within an employment relationship". In the first article of the 2011 Domestic Work Convention (C189), it is emphasized that "a person who performs domestic work only occasionally or sporadically and not on an occupational basis is not a domestic worker". Some authors of domestic work have reflected the current status of this sector in their description. Domestic work is a 3D job (dirty, dangerous, and degrading) and workers often have short-term contracts or no contracts at all (Wolffers, et.al, 2003).

According to the definition of the ILO, domestic work covers a variety of work such as cooking, cleaning, washing and ironing, general housework, caring for children, the elderly and the disabled, as well as gardening, guarding the household vicinity and driving for the family (ILO, 2012). Furthermore, the ILO argues that duties and services vary among countries and variants may depend on several factors such as the age, gender, ethnicity and migration status of the workers involved. Moreover, while there is little data revealing the scope and complexity of domestic work, the available information on the living and working conditions of domestic workers raises serious concerns in regards to employment-related violence, including forced labor, human trafficking and other forms of abuses. (ILO, 2007).

Fraga (2009) has distinguished domestic workers into three types-resident, full-time, and charwomen. Resident domestic workers are those workers living at the workplace or household

they work for during the period of employment. The full-time workers are those who earn a salary as remuneration for their work but do not live or stay in their workplace. On the other hand, charwomen are the domestic workers who are paid on a daily basis and may render services to more than one employer or household. In addition, the ILO has divided domestic workers by types based on the nature of work they perform. Types include day workers who work continuously for a particular individual employer; stay-in employees working continuously for a particular individual employer; workers who provide weekly/monthly part-time domestic services to one/more individual employers; casual workers employed by cleaning firms and temporary casual workers providing occasional services (ILO, 2013).

The discussion above has implicitly covered the unique characteristics of domestic labor. This type of labor is generally seen as a low-skilled job for poor women. This particular attribution of the sector reveals the gendered and unpaid nature of domestic labor. Moreover, it is also highly informal and personal. This association stems from the fact that domestic labor usually takes place behind closed-doors in private households. Therefore, local level preventive measures to protect the rights and promote the welfare of the workers are essentially indispensable as law enforcement cannot be easily implemented in private households, which serve as the workplace for this group of workers. However, pushing for macro level policies are equally significant as globalization has exported domestic labor services across borders through labor migration. This phenomenon links domestic labor and international migration.

Although often perceived as a new phenomenon, human migration has always existed in human history for centuries. Traditionally, individuals and groups of people migrate to escape war and conflict, escape poverty and hunger, escape religious and political oppression, find better economic and employment opportunities, trade and travel (Gunda, 2021). Currently, over 86 million people are estimated to be employed in foreign lands. This has led to the continuous effort to ensure their security and safety all throughout their migration experience. However, a large segment of international migrant workers especially those in the low-skilled labor sectors continue to suffer problems. In the domestic labor sector, despite the efforts made to ensure the protection of migrant household workers, they still experience numerous problems, and remain vulnerable to exploitative employment. While creating jobs in their home countries remains to be the best option, more and more countries consider international labor migration as a key strategy to promote national development. They take advantage of the employment

opportunities globally and count on foreign currency brought in by overseas workers. Labor migration in countries of origin can alleviate the pressure on unemployment and contribute to development through the channeling of remittances, transfer of know-how and creation of business and trade networks. In destination countries with labor shortages, regular and well-managed labor migration can alleviate labor shortages, facilitate mobility and add to the human capital stock. Therefore, clearly formulated labor migration policies, legislation and effective strategies are essential to protect migrant workers and optimize the benefits of labor migration for both the country of origin and destination and the migrants themselves (Gunda, 2021).

Several studies have tackled domestic work within the context of international migration. One central theme of the discourse on the subject matter focuses on understanding the factors that fuel demand for domestic work in the developed countries. In this regard, the ILO looks at the entry of women professionals from the middle and upper class into various fields as resulting into the need for workers providing caregiving and domestic services on a part-time and full-time basis. In some countries, local domestic workers cannot supply the demand for live-in caregiver and domestic services. This gap brought to the fore the migrant domestic workers as labor supply to the increasing demand for such workers (ILO,2013). However, for other employers, this form of employment not only responds to their service needs but also consolidates the identity and lifestyle that they want to demonstrate.

In Türkiye, domestic work literature has revealed that many employers justified their preference for migrant women on the basis of their "European" and "civilized" status compared to lower class, uneducated and essentially rural nature of domestic women. This further strengthen the idea that migrant women are better in performing their jobs and, in any case, it is not possible to find live-in domestic workers ready to work for the same pay (Demirdirek, 2007: 17, Keough, 2003). Moreover, in the Middle Eastern countries where women's participation in the labor market is very limited, there have been high demands for migrant domestic service providers as a social status symbol. What can be understood from these constructs is the fact that there are other factors that fuel the globalization of domestic labor.

As cited in Gunda (2021), research studies show that migrant domestic workers suffer structural discrimination in their host countries. This phenomenon intersects with the harsh impact of the COVID-19 pandemic in terms of inequalities in employment. The most relevant example is the scenario of migrant domestic workers employed in the Middle East under the famous Kafala

System, a system that excludes migrant domestic workers from the national labor legislation (Amnesty International, 2019). Furthermore, worker's welfare and to some extent the protection of their basic human rights are generally dependent on their employer's benevolence (Huda, 2006); And employers under this system exercise power and control which can be likened to labor exploitation through human trafficking (Hamill, 2011).

Türkiye has evolved from being a transit country for workers moving from countries in the Middle East enroute to Europe to a destination country for migrant domestic workers. The major coverage areas of domestic work for migrant workers are housework, care for children and the elderly. Türkiye is one of the countries without legislation on domestic labor. Consequently, the country is faced with highly informal employment practices in domestic work. The informally employed domestic workers in the country experience problems such as vague job description, long working hours, occupational health, safety and some degree of low wages. Based on a study by ILO, domestic workers in Türkiye are also vulnerable to psychological, physical and sexual harassment at work; the casual employment practice expose workers to long working hours and the lack of social security coverage; they are currently excluded from the scope of the country's labor code, but are covered by the law of obligations (Gunda, 2021).

As cited in Gunda (2021), an informant who has served as an officer of the Filipino Community in Türkiye (FCT) talked about his arrival in Türkiye in the late 1980s. He shared that he is the first male OFW to have arrived in Türkiye and reiterated that the Filipino migration to Türkiye began in the 1990s. His claim is reflected in the literature on Filipino labor migration to Türkiye. Following the increased demand for migrant domestic workers in Türkiye, Filipinos joined the market through employment in the rich households especially in Istanbul since 1990s (Özbay, 2019). In addition, Filipino workers filled the demand for childcare services, as patient and elderly care was mostly preferred by female workers in post-Soviet countries. This resulted in the emergence of specialization in care services that is based on nationality (Deniz, 2018). Since then, the number of migration rates from the Philippines to Türkiye has steadily increased. The total number of registered was 3,036 in 2020. However, there are also many undocumented Filipino workers in Türkiye.

Up to this day, the biggest obstacle on labor migration flows from the Philippines to Turkiye is the lack of bilateral labor agreement between the two countries. However, there are three

identified modes of labor migration flows from the Philippines to Türkiye. Earlier arrival was composed of Filipinos coming in the company of Diplomats they are working for in the 1990s; the second mode is associated with the conflicts in the Gulf States, war in the region has led to many Filipinos ending up in Türkiye as an escape; and the third route is through the recruitment agencies in the Philippines (Akalın, 2014). Employees of multinational companies would come to Türkiye with their Filipina helpers in the 1990s (Özbay, 2019; Weylan, 1997). Those who were coming both directly from the Philippines and the Gulf States initially aimed to Türkiye as a transit country leading to different countries in Europe. Considering it as a bridge to Europe, especially Italy where most of the Catholics live, Türkiye is deemed as safer than countries in the Arab world and the working conditions can be relatively better than in countries like Kuwait, UAE or Qatar (Paul, 2011; Sabban, 2014). Akalın reports in her research work that there are also Filipinas who arrived in Türkiye after deportation from their former host countries and that they came to evade exploitation and abuse (Akalın, 2014). She added that Filipinos in Türkiye can work legally with a work permit acquired through their employers and are often with the support of recruitment agencies. Otherwise, they may get a tourist visa from the Turkish embassy in Manila which is valid for a few weeks and if they continue beyond the validity period to stay without a work permit, they will eventually fall under "undocumented" or "irregular" status (Akalın, 2014).

Gürsün (2021), as noted in (Ayaydın, 2020; Weyland, 1997; & Deniz, 2018), argues that in Türkiye, the literature on Filipino household workers and nannies portrays them with several character traits such as calm, disciplined, docile, hardworking, task-oriented and obedient. As mentioned in the previous sections, one of the most important assets of OFWs is their English language proficiency. This also applies to migrant domestic worker employers in Türkiye. However, Ayaydın argues that knowledge of the English language alone is not enough to bring Filipino workers to a higher position in the domestic labor market hierarchy in Türkiye. He points out that what makes them status symbols for their employers, who are concerned about their reputation and social class, is their representational and social image as "ideal nannies" and "more expensive global goods" (Ayaydın, 2020). According to Gürsün, a Filipino caregiver is a very prestigious element because everyone knows the high cost of this service and the family, which has economic capital, is aware of this value (Gürsün, 2021). In this context, Petra

Weyland argues that Turkish employers benefit from Filipinos' cultural characteristics, modern clothing, language capital and class symbol they carry (Weyland, 1997).

Methodology

This explorative research study employed two of the most commonly used qualitative research methods such as participant observation and in-depth interviews. Participant observation was conducted through frequent visits and participation to different activities organized by several Filipino Communities in Türkiye. During these visits, the researcher conducted key-informant interviews with some of the leaders of these organizations. Interview with key informants has helped in the selection or recruitment of potential study participants who were sampled through spatial and targeted snowball sampling methods. These methods were chosen due to lack of sample frame which is a common nature of the domestic labor and also to lessen convenience in general snowball sampling. Furthermore, the collection of the primary data was conducted through the in-depth interviews with eighteen (18) Filipino household workers who were currently employed in Türkiye during the interview sessions from the 6th of May to the 17th of June 2022. The interviews were mostly done face-to-face during the day off of the participants. However, a few of the study respondents preferred to be interviewed online due to varying reasons inclusive of security concerns, distance of the place of employment, and most importantly time constraints. The interviews were guided by the research instrument which is an interview topic guide that contains questions seeking to inquire on the employment practices and working conditions of the study respondents. The expected issue on time constraint was prevented by pilot-testing the interview instrument beforehand. So, the average interview time was between 45-65 minutes. The secondary data utilized in this study were sourced from related news reports/articles and from the community's group chats and pages on different social media platforms such as Facebook and WhatsApp. Thematic analysis which involves, transcription of recorded data; coding; creation of themes and analyzing of the data through themes were applied to analyze the collected data using NVivo- a software program used for qualitative data processing and analysis.

Findings and Discussion

Profile of the Study Respondents

Initially, a total of twenty (20) Filipino household workers have given their consent to participate in the study. However, due to sickness and re-employment, two of the previously 20 sampled participants were not able to participate in the interviews as scheduled, leaving the total respondents down to a total of eighteen (18). As illustrated in the succeeding table, the respondents are profiled based on their age, marital status, highest educational attainment, legal status and type of work arrangement. For the purpose of practicing confidentiality which was explicitly explained in the informed consent, the identity of the respondents are written as R1-R18. R means respondent and the attached number refers to the order or sequence of the interviews in ascending manner. R1 is the respondent interviewed first while R18 is the one that got interviewed last.

As shown in Table 1 below, the age of the study respondents ranged from the youngest 29 and the oldest 46 with over 83% over 30 years old. This gives an impression that all the workers are still within the range of the productive years of their lives. As for their marital status, none of the participants were single and there are two widowed. The rest of the participants are either married (61%) or separated (27%). With the absence of divorce law in the Philippines, couples who decide to discontinue their marriage seek for annulment can apply for marriage annulment which is usually a long and expensive process. During the interviews, only one of the respondents who are separated from their husbands have applied for the annulment. Others cited the financial aspect of the process as a hindrance to that maximum legal way for separation. The respondents have a decent education level varying from at least high school graduates to university graduates.

Significantly, younger workers who possess only high school diploma has attached TESDA[3] Certificate as a supplement to their credentials. Such practice is a manifestation of the Philippine continuous effort to upgrade the competencies and qualifications of their labor force even for work considered as low-skilled. However, although the presence of university graduates employed in the sector may imply quality and the prestige of migrant Filipino household workers it also proves the reality of the brain-drain phenomenon in labor migration.

---

[3] Acronym for the Technical Education and Skills development Authority in the Philippines

Nevertheless, the general education level of the study respondents shows one of the factors that put Filipino household workers on top of the hierarchy in the international domestic labor market.

Table 1: Summary of the Respondents' Profile

Number	Age	Marital Status	Educational Attainment	Legal Status	Work Arrangement
R1	30	Separated	High School+TESDA	Documented	Stay-in
R2	42	Married	College (Incomplete)	Documented	Stay-in
R3	39	Married	College (Incomplete)	Documented	Stay-in
R4	41	Married	College Graduate	Documented	Stay-in
R5	38	Separated	High School	Undocumented	Stay-out
R6	43	Widowed	High School	Documented	Stay-in
R7	34	Separated	High School	Documented	Stay-in
R8	39	Married	College Graduate	Documented	Stay-in
R9	37	Married	High School	Undocumented	Stay-in
R10	29	Married	High School+TESDA	Undocumented	Stay-out
R11	34	Married	College Graduate	Documented	Stay-in
R12	36	Married	College (Incomplete)	Documented	Stay-in
R13	30	Married	High School+TESDA	Documented	Stay-in
R14	35	Separated	High School+TESDA	Undocumented	Stay-in
R15	35	Married	College (Incomplete)	Undocumented	Stay-in
R16	46	Widowed	College (Incomplete)	Documented	Stay-in
R17	34	Separated	High School +TESDA	Undocumented	Stay-in

R18	36	Married	College (Incomplete)	Documented	Stay-in

Under the legal status, the respondents are either documented or undocumented. In this study, legally documented workers or regular workers refer to those who have both residence and work permits. On the other hand, undocumented workers refer to those who have either a legal residence permit or work permit. In short, documented workers are those who are permitted to work legally in Türkiye. As indicated in table 1 above, there are 6 which accounts for over 33% who do not have a permit to work legally in Türkiye. Furthermore, only one of them has a legal residence permit. The issue on legality covered in this research has a multi-dimensional nature. It is a shared-concern between the source and the host countries. It implies the loopholes in the labor migration policies of the Philippines and Turkiye. From the lens of social work as a champion in the advocacy of human rights and social justice, this issue is a major factor in the exploitative and vulnerable employment conditions of the Filipino household workers in Turkiye. It is therefore a field of social work research as potential human rights violations and socioeconomic injustice can come out of the highly probable employment of inhumane systems and processes to which such vulnerable and to some extent disadvantaged groups are subjected. Finally, in terms of work arrangements, only two of the respondents are stay-out. This is expected as the available domestic labor literature in Türkiye shows that migrant workers in Türkiye are intended for stay-in work arrangements which do not attract local workers. This particular aspect of domestic labor employment practices in Turkiye is also crucial to the well-being of the workers as it is highly complicated and is one of the major factors that cause inconvenience to the domestic workers. To some extent, most of the work-related conditions of household workers are dependent on the situation inside the household where they provide domestic services.

Employment Practices

Based on the thematic analysis of the respondents' narratives, three main themes under employment practices are identified as a) pre-employment practices, b) recruitment or job search practices, and c) use of formal employment practices. These themes are discussed in detail below.

Pre-employment Practices

Prior to employment search, Filipino household workers undergo trainings, seminars, and workshops to prepare themselves for domestic labor abroad. In addition to the usual skills required in traditional housekeeping, child and elderly care, they also spend time on learning religious and cultural practices of their chosen destination countries. Often, they spend their hard-earned money to be able avail of the mentioned skill-upgrade endeavors. However, their experiences with this aspect of their employment practices often varies.

I am lucky that despite my low educational level as only a high school graduate, I was granted an opportunity to enroll for a TESDA program. I chose to take-up a course in childcare as I intended to work abroad as a babysitter (R1, 30). I attended a seminar-workshop to upgrade my skills in elderly care (R17, 34). Prior to employment, I joined a kind of refresher course in child and elderly care because I was applying for re-employment after 5 years of unemployment (R16, 46). I got a seminar on cultural awareness since I was coming from an employment in Europe. I believe that culture in Turkiye is quite different (R8, 39). With my background as a midwife college student, I only needed to upgrade my skills in traditional housekeeping (R15, 35). My agency asked me too much money for pre-departure training which is not really applied in practice (R14, 35). I borrowed money to pay for my pre-departure training (R10, 29).

This aspect of employment practices is significant as it does not only add to the credentials of the workers but also equipped them with knowledge relevant to their social cohesion as workers in foreign lands. However, the system and the policies which cover this aspect should prevent incidence of over pricing and any form of practice similar to corruption as recipients of these services are usually from the poor strata of society.

Recruitment or Job Search Practices

In general, one of the major issues in international labor migration is irregular migration. This usually takes places through recruitment practices or job search practices undertaken by potential migrant workers. In the case of the Filipino Household Workers in Türkiye who participated in this study, their single point of entry to Turkiye was through recruitment agencies. Referral remains to be the most common job search practice among this group of workers. They are cautious of risky and dubious recruitment sites online due to the cases of human trafficking propagated by illegal recruiters in the past. However, not all the workers

chose Turkiye as host country, some of them were originally recruited for employment in Europe with Turkiye as a transit country. Others are employed in Turkiye after escaping their employer in different countries, usually in the Middle East.

Table 2: *Summary of the Respondents Portal of Entry*

Respondents	Portal of Entry	Mode of Entry
R1	Agency	Indirect
R2	Agency	Direct
R3	Agency	Direct
R4	Referral	Indirect
R5	Referral	Indirect
R6	Agency	Direct
R7	Referral	Indirect
R8	Agency	Direct
R9	Referral	Direct
R10	Referral	Indirect
R11	Agency	Direct
R12	Referral	Indirect
R13	Agency	Indirect
R14	Referral	Direct
R15	Agency	Direct

R16	Agency	Indirect
R17	Agency	Indirect
R18	Referral	Indirect

My agency has recruited me for Italy only to be held illegally in Türkiye for no verified reason (R17, 34). My boss brought me here from Kuwait. When some grievances and disagreements happened, they threatened to send me back home illegally. I found ways to escape and hid for a few months before I got reemployed by a Turkish employer through a recruitment agency based in Turkiye (R1, 30). I entered with a tourist visa and got employed through an acquaintance's referral (R7, 34).

Table 2 shows us the pattern of labor market access of Filipino household workers in Turkiye. They are either hired through recruitment agencies or via referral through relatives, friends and networks. The mode of entry refers to how they entered Türkiye. Those who entered Türkiye directly are the workers who arrived directly from the Philippines for the purpose of employment. On the other hand, indirect mode of entry refers to those who came to Türkiye from other countries of destinations and those who arrived directly from the Philippines without the required work permit. Most of them came with tourist visas. This aspect of the employment practices of this group of workers opens the door for informal and irregular employment. It therefore puts the workers at risk of exploitative working conditions, human trafficking and forced labor.

Use of Formal Employment Practices

This aspect of the employment practices refers to contractual arrangements, provision of employment insurance, and the general terms and conditions of contractual employment. The workers who are employed legally are provided with the copy of the written contract which they have signed with their employers. Included in the terms of their employment contracts are the payment of social insurance and the measures for the termination of the signed contract. The undocumented workers settle for the verbal agreement with their employers. One of the interesting findings of the study is the lack of payment receipts or any payslips which records

payment of the remuneration. Both parties seem to rely on mutual trust. Although this signifies a healthy employment relationship, this can potentially be abused by both parties especially when grievances and misunderstanding happened.

I signed a contract with my employer prior to employment (R4, 41). Upon contract signing, I see to it that the terms and conditions are fair and not biased against me (R11,34). Prior to contract signing, I read the terms carefully and asked my friends to check and look it up to avoid any irregularities which can be used against me in the future (R8, 39). I signed two versions of the contract, one in English and Turkish, this almost became a deal breaker as I initially refused to sign both as my Turkish is not good (R18, 36). I didn't sign any contract because I am illegal. I only depend and trust on the verbal agreement my referral and I have managed to ask from my employer (R14, 35). I didn't need any contract, as I am stay-out and working on a part-time basis (R5, 35).

Use of formal employment practice such as signing and acquiring a copy of employment contract is essential not only for the employees but also to employers. It guarantees job security and fair terms and conditions in cases of employment termination and separation. With the nature of the sector hounded by high informality, violations of terms and conditions of employment are not less expected. As a preventive measure, policies should be strengthened to promote and enforce compliance to formal employment practices. Workers should be made fully-aware and cautious of the eventual consequences of irregular employment practices.

Working Conditions

Based on the generated data from the in-depth interviews, the study respondents emphasized their working conditions on various themes which are summed up into a) job description, b) working hours and leaves, c) remuneration & incentives, d) healthcare, and e) disputes and grievances. Each theme is tackled below.

Job Description

On paper, job description is generally clear. However, it can get vague and sometimes inhumane in practice. Usually, Filipino household workers in Turkiye are hired for childcare as other workers from other nationalities are favored for elderly care and traditional housekeeping. The reality is that household workers are isolated in private households. Their availability for 24 hours six times a week allows them to perform tasks aside from agreed function and roles in the contractual agreement. This does not usually happen as forced, as some workers tend to

accept it wholeheartedly as a manifestation of their commitment to their job. However, complaints arise when it becomes too vague as employers require their employees to perform non-domestic tasks such as cleaning of other household and family work places.

I was hired as a babysitter but my boss would require me to do other chores whenever possible (R13, 30). Even though my main task is to look after a 5 year old boy, my boss would sometimes call me to go to their office for cleaning whenever their cleaner is on leave (R9, 37). I usually help in the traditional housekeeping when I have free time. But this good gesture of mine was abused by some members of the household and became a source of disagreement with my boss (R2, 42).

Working Hours and Leaves

Another issue when it comes to the working conditions of the Filipino household workers is fixed working hours and leaves. As stay-in workers, most of their time passed within the household as they only have one day break in a week. Some workers have only one day break in two weeks. Depending on their contract, some of them are able to go on leave once a year. Leaves can either be paid or unpaid. Workers have accepted this aspect of household labor. It is left in the conscience of their employers to reward their own employees for such a gesture and prevent abuse of these working conditions.

I take care of a 2-year-old girl. I have to attend to her needs even at midnight (R6, 43). Regardless of the time of the day and night, I am obliged to provide my service whenever necessary as I live under the same roof with my employers. This pissed me off but I have no choice (R13, 30). My 3-year-old girl is much more dependent on me than her real mother. Even on my day off, my female boss would call me just to console her daughter who would cry and look for me (R12, 36).

Remuneration and Incentives

Among all the different aspects of working conditions of the Filipino household workers, it is the perks of having a very high salary rate that gives them consolation and motivation. Filipinas are on top of the domestic labor market hierarchy in Türkiye. Their prestige image which is popularly accepted in Turkish households make them earn an average of one-thousand US dollars monthly. This rate is not only very high in the domestic labor sector but also a lot higher than the salary of workers in many professional and high skilled occupations including public

health workers and teachers. Even the undocumented ones receive decent remuneration. Aside from the monthly salary, they also receive some incentives in the form of weekly allowances given every day off. Some employers pay and allow their employees to attend special courses of their choice like driving lesson and Turkish language course.

I did not finish my bachelor's degree but I am receiving a monthly salary higher than some local professional workers (R13, 30). I am a university graduate but I know that my degree will not earn me the salary that I get as a household worker in Turkiye (R11, 34). I am risking my life for working illegally, but the good thing is that I am receiving a monthly salary equal to what the legal workers receive (R14, 35).

Grievances and Disagreements

To further understand the working conditions of the study respondents, they were asked to talk about the usual sources of grievances and disagreements involving them and their employers. The majority cited vague job descriptions and irregular working hours scheduled as the usual cause of arguments. These work-related problems are an obvious violation of the agreed upon terms and conditions indicated in the employment contract. Some of the documented workers voiced out concerns regarding a possible switch of salary currency from US dollars to Turkish Lira due to the current economic situation in Turkiye. Minor issues such as delayed payment of salary is considered by the workers as normal and tolerable. However, unsecured irregular workers have reported repeated experiences of problems such as delayed and unnecessary salary deductions and at times non-payment of salary which usually leads to resignation from work despite threats from the employers.

I am currently satisfied with my work, especially my salary. However, I am worried as my employer is suggesting the possibility of switching from US dollars to Turkish Lira (R10, 29). I sometimes argue with my employer regarding overwork, but we resolve the issues through payment of overtime pay (R15, 35). Problems occur when my employers try to abuse the vagueness of my job descriptions. I can only tolerate to a certain extent but not when it reached to the point of abuse (R18, 36). I have experienced resigning from work after repeated incidences of non-payment of my salary. If you are undocumented, some employers try to exploit your situation. You just need to be vigilant and be ready for your rights (R9,37). I once fought

back against my employers who attempted to refuse to pay me for two-month work and tried to hold my documents. They even threatened to report me to the authority (R17, 34).

Regarding their coping mechanisms, workers talked about the active participation and membership to some Filipino organizations. Through this network, they not only get acquaintances but also advisers who can help them overcome their work-related challenges. However, an implied challenge to working with this group of workers is their general closed mindedness in regards to coordination with people from other nationalities or with local people. They tend to suspect non-fellow Filipinos of jealousy and spying. So, they prefer to stay within the circle of fellow OFWs.

Conclusion

The study explored the experiences of the Filipino Household Workers in Turkiye in terms of their employment practices along with some aspects of their working conditions. It presents valuable information about the pre-employment practices, job search practices and the use of formal employment practices of this group of migrant workers who are considered as one of the best providers of domestic labor services and claimed to be on top of the hierarchy in the domestic labor market. However, despite the mentioned accolade, this group of household workers have experienced employment and work related issues which stem from the nature and unique characteristics of the still undervalued and poorly regulated sector as evident by their narratives on working conditions in terms of job description, working hours, remuneration and common causes of argument with employers. Significantly, the majority of the study participants have expressed satisfaction with the remuneration aspect of their work.

The irregularity in terms of labor market access practices implies loopholes and room for improvements in the labor migration policies in both the Philippines and Turkiye. Through the lens of social work practice, these issues call for comprehensive policies which can be achieved through extensive research and policy development in micro and macro levels. Without these, inhumane processes and systems will continue to prosper in this sector endangering the general welfare of the vulnerable and disadvantaged groups of migrant household workers. Given the socioeconomic value of domestic labor, researchers and policy makers should utilize the interdisciplinary approach to this global phenomenon. In this regard, social work practice remains an essential discipline that should be on the frontline in the quest for advocacy of

human rights promotion and quest for socioeconomic justice. This research shows that labor migration issues faced by migrant domestic workers is a social problems requiring social work interventions.

To mitigate both the mid-term and long term impact of the employment and working conditions issues faced by migrant Filipino Household Workers in Turkiye and the migrant domestic workers as a whole, this research highly recommends the following lists of recommendations. Further research studies of the subject matter with broader scope and more respondents should be conducted to promote the general well-being this group of migrant workers; Human rights advocates and researchers should support research and advocacy for the strict implementation of labor law involving the migrant domestic workers; Both sending and host countries should strengthen their campaign against illegal employment, their support for financial literacy trainings for this group of workers, provision of trusted access to services and assistance in times of harassment and violence; And proper and effective education for domestic workers in regards to their labor rights, and occupational safety and health to help them become empowered individuals.

References

- Anam, M. Z., Warsito, T., Al-Fadhat, F., Pribadi, U., & Sugito, S. (2021). COVID-19 and Decent Work: Online Media Coverage on Indonesian Female Migrant Domestic Workers in Malaysia and Taiwan. *Sociology and Technoscience*, *11*(2), 160-193.

- Aoun, R. (2020). COVID-19 impact on female migrant domestic workers in the middle east. *GBV AoR Helpdesk*, 2020-05.

- Blackett, A. (2012). The decent work for domestic workers' convention and recommendation, 2011. American Journal of International Law, 106(4), 778-794.

- Brites, J. G. (2013). Domestic work: issues, literature and policies. Cadernos de Pesquisa, 43 (149), 422-451. Retrieved February 2020 at https://www.scielo.br/j/cp/a/PFk9XcQfLkjkns9TKBny8sb/?format=pdf&lang=en

- Budlender, D. (2011). Measuring the economic and social value of domestic work. ILO.

- Çelik, N. (2005). Immigrant domestic women workers in Ankara and İstanbul (Master's thesis).

- Demirkol, B. (2018). Yabancıların Türkiye'de Çalışması ve Uluslararası İşgücü Kanunu (Working in Türkiye for Foreigners and the Act on International Labour). Galatasaray Üniversitesi Hukuk Fakültesi Dergisi (Journal of Galatasaray University Faculty of Law)(2018/1), 421-482.

- Deshingkar, P., Zeitlyn, B., & Holtom, B. (2014). Does migration for domestic work reduce poverty? A review of the literature and an agenda for research.

- Dinçer, C. G. (2014). In between countries: experiences of women migrant domestic workers from Georgia in Türkiye (Master's thesis).

- EFE, S. S. (2017). Legal Status and Economic Membership of Seasonal Migrant Workers in Türkiye. Göç Araştırmaları Dergisi, 3(2), 66-99.

- Ege, G. (2002). Foreign domestic workers in Türkiye: a new form of trafficking in women? (Master's thesis).

- Erken, B. (2016). Uluslararası İşgücü Kanunu Çerçevesinde Türkiye'de Yabancıların Çalışması. TISK Academy/TISK Akademi, 11(22).

- Gunda, A. (2021). Employment Relationship in Domestic Work: An Exploratory Study on the Employment Practices and Working Conditions of Filipino Household Workers in Türkiye. Thesis Proposal (Unpublished)

- GUNDA, A. (2021). The Impact of Coronavirus Disease (COVID-19) Pandemic on Migrant Domestic Workers: A Case Study in Türkiye. *PROCEEDINGS E-BOOK*, 18.

- Hulme, D. (2014). Qualitative Research on Employment Relationship and Working Conditions: Preliminary Guidelines.

- ILO. 2013a. Domestic workers across the world: Global and regional statistics and the extent of legal protection. Geneva. Retrieved on January 10 2021 at https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---dcomm/---publ/documents/publication/wcms_173363.pdf

- ILO. 2013b. Global Momentum grows for domestic workers' legislation. Available at: http:// www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/newsroom/news/WCMS_208727/lang--en/index.htm [Accessed 10 January 2021]

- ILO. 2014a. Global Wage Report 2014/15: Wages and income inequality. Geneva.

- ILO. 2014b. Domestic work is a professional job, 16 Apr. 2014.

- ILO/FOFRLAC. 2015. Promoción de la formalización del trabajo doméstico en Uruguay. Available at: http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---americas/---ro-lima/docu ments/publication/wcms_371217.pdf [Accessed 20 January 2021]

- Jureidini, R. (2011). An exploratory study of psychoanalytic and social factors in the abuse of migrant domestic workers by female employers in Lebanon. KAFA (enough) Violence & Exploitation.

- Kara, H. (2016). Understanding female domestic worker's daily mobilities: a case study in Ankara. Unpublished Master's thesis Ankara: Middle East Technical University.

- Karaağaç, Ö. (2018). Yabancıların Türkiye'de Çalışmalarına İlişkin Temel Düzenleme Olarak Uluslararası İşgücü Kanununun Genel Değerlendirmesi. Çankaya Üniversitesi Hukuk Fakültesi Dergisi, 3(1), 89-121.

- Kaşka, S. (2009). The new international migration and migrant women in Türkiye: The case of Moldovan domestic workers. Land of diverse migrations: Challenges of emigration and immigration in Türkiye, 725-804.

- Kelly, A., & Thompson, H. (2015). The vanished: The Filipino domestic workers who disappear behind closed doors. The Guardian, 24.

- Labor Code of the Philippines Renumbered. (2017). DOLE

- Lutz, H., & Palenga-Möllenbeck, E. (2011). Care, gender and migration: Towards a theory of transnational domestic work migration in Europe. Journal of Contemporary European Studies, 19 (3), 349-364.

- McKay, D. (2007). 'Sending dollars shows feeling'–emotions and economies in Filipino migration. Mobilities, 2(2), 175-194.

- Melkas, H., & Anker, R. (1998). Gender equality and occupational segregation in Nordic labour markets. International Labour Organization.

- Mendoza, N., Mordeno, I., Latkin, C., & Hall, B. (2017). Evidence of the paradoxical effect of social network support: A study among Filipino domestic workers in China. Psychiatry research, 255, 263-271.

- Milkman, R., Reese, E., & Roth, B. (1998). The macrosociology of paid domestic labor. Work and occupations, 25(4), 483-510.

- Motherhood as the Value of Labour: The Migrant Domestic Workers' Market in Türkiye. Australian Feminist Studies, 30(83), 65-81.

- Murakami, E. Y. (2021). The impact of migration and remittances on labor supply in Tajikistan. Journal of Asian Economics, 73, 101268.

- Oelz, M., & Rani, U. (2015). Domestic work, wages, and gender equality: Lessons from developing countries. ILO.

- Ofreneo, R., & Samonte, I. (2005). Empowering Filipino migrant workers: Policy issues and challenges. International migration papers, 64.

- Paul, A. M. (2013). Good help is hard to find: the differentiated mobilisation of migrant social capital among Filipino domestic workers. Journal of Ethic and Migration Studies 39, no. 5, 719-739.

- Pereira, M., & Valiente, H. (2007). Regímenes Jurídicos Sobre Trabajo Doméstico Remunerado en Los Estados Del Mercosur: Regimes Jurídicos Sobre Trabalho Doméstico Remunerado Nos Estados Do Mercosul. Cotidiano Mujer

- Rani, E., & Saluja, R. (2016). A Study on Domestic Help Workers and Factors Affecting Realisation of their Rights in the State of Punjab.

- Reznick, A. (2018). Domestic worker abuse. Guardian (Sydney), (1822), 7.

- Sabban, R. (2002). United Arab Emirates: Migrant Women in the United Arab Emirates. The Case of Female Domestic Workers. Gender Promotion Program.

- Salazar, B., Wets, J., Seiger, F. K., & Timmerman, C. (tarih yok). Migration at Work: Aspirations, Imaginaries & Structures of Mobility. Leuven: Leuven University Press. (CC BY 4.0).

- Sayres, N. J. (2005). An analysis of the situation of Filipino domestic workers. ILO-Sub-regional Office.

- Sorj, B., & Fraga, A. (2020). Leave policies and social inequality in Brazil. International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy.

- Soyseçkin, İ. S. (2014). Nature and dynamics of informal paid child care in Türkiye: Commodification due to insufficient welfare policies.

- Stenberg, C. (2019). The Hidden Hand of Domestic Labor: Domestic Employers' Work Practices in Chicago, USA. Frontiers in Sociology, 4, 80.

- Tayah, M. J. (2016). Decent work for migrant domestic workers: Moving the agenda forward. Geneva: International Labor Organisation.

- Tomei, M., & Belser, P. (2011). New ILO standards on decent work for domestic workers: A summary of the issues and discussions. International Labour Review, 150(3-4), 431-438.

- Toksöz, G., & Erdoğdu, S. (2012). The Visible Face of Women's Invisible Anam, M. Z., Warsito, T., Al-Fadhat, F., Pribadi, U., & Sugito, S. (2021). COVID-19 and Decent Work: Online Media Coverage on Indonesian Female Migrant Domestic Workers in Malaysia and Taiwan. *Sociology and Technoscience*, *11*(2), 160-193.

Türkiye'de Dil Politikaları Kapsamında Dil İnşası

Bakhshanda Rafieva[1]

Özet

Bu araştırmanın amacı Türkiye Cumhuriyetinde Dil Politikası'nın nasıl şekillendiğini ve topluma olan etkisini incelemektir. Türkiye Cumhuriyeti'nin Dil Politikası çözümlenirken, öncelikle dil ve dilin ilişkili olduğu ana kavramlara yer verilmiş, ardından Türk dilinin politik anlamda şekillenmesi tarihi sürece bağlı olarak ortaya konmuştur.

Türk Dil Politikası, Cumhuriyet öncesi dönem ve Cumhuriyet döneminde yaşanan gelişmeler göz önünde bulundurularak irdelenmiştir. Cumhuriyet öncesi dönem incelenirken; dil politikasını şekillendiren bazı siyasal karar ve uygulamalamalara yer verilmiştir. Bu etkenler Türk Devletlerinin kronolojik varoluşlarından bağımsız olarak ele alınmıştır. Ayrıca Osmanlı Devleti'nin son dönemleri ağırlıklı olmak üzere Türkiye Cumhuriyeti'ne geçiş sürecinde dil alanında yaşanan gelişmeler ortaya konmuştur.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Dil Politikası, Güneş Dil Teorisi, Türkçe'nin Toplumdaki Yeri, Dil Statüsü

Disiplin: Disiplinlerarası çalışma: Siyaset Bilimi ve Dil Bilimi

Giriş

"Dil; insanlar arasında anlaşmayı, duygu düşünce alışverişini sağlayan, bilinmeyen bir zamanda, bilinmeyen bir biçimde oluşan, ait olduğu toplumu her yönüyle ifade eden, işaret ettiği varlık ve kavramlarla arasında doğrudan bir ilişki bulunmayan nedensiz ses sembollerinin oluşturduğu, yaşayan ve doğal bir sistemdir". Dil, herhangi bir toplumun ya da bir ulusa ait bireylerin kendi aralarında anlaşma sağlayan yerleşik dizge olarak ifade edilebilir (Bayraktar, 2006, 1).

---

[1]İstanbul Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Siyaset Bilimi ve Uluslararası İlişkiler Doktora Öğrencisi

Toplumbilimcilere göre dil; ulusu ulus yapan temel ögelerden başlıcası ve birisi olmakla birlikte tek ve yeter koşuldur. Ulus demek dil demektir. Bir toplumun ulus olabilmesi için halkın içinde yaşayan, gelişen ve konuşulagelen bir dil gereklidir (Selçuk, 1976, 121). Dilin diğer etkili ve önemli özelliklerinden birisi de kişileri birbirine bağlama özelliğidir ki, bu özellik insan topluluklarını gelişigüzel ve sıradan topluluk olmaktan çıkarıp ulus olma aşamasına eriştirir (Özdemir, 1969, 15).

Geçmişten beri aynı dili konuşan insan toplulukları "millet" olarak adlandırılan sosyal varlığın özünü ve temelini oluşturmaktadırlar. Dil, duygu ve düşünceyi insanların birbirlerine aktarmasına vesile olur. Bu nedenle dil, toplulukları birer kitle, birer yığın olmaktan çıkarır, onları aralarında "duygu ve düşünce" birliği olan birer toplum, millet haline getirir ve yaşatır (Kaplan, 2009, 39).

Bazı devletlerdeki farklı dillerin statüleri çoğu zaman tartışma konusu olmuştur. Bundan dolayı bu ülkelerde çeşitli dil planlamaları uygulanmıştır. Dil statüsü planlaması; aynı siyasal sınırlar içerisinde bulunan ve birbiri ile ilişki halindeki dillerin yasal statüsünü düzenlemeye yönelik müdahalelerdir. Bazı devletlerde tüm dillere yönelik koruyucu-geliştirici dil politikaları uygulanırken bazılarında ise yok etme-asimile etme dil politikaları uygulanmaktadır. Bu politikalar her ülkenin anayasasında yerini alırken kamusal yaşamın çeşitli alanlarında hangi dil veya dillerin kullanılacağına ve bazı ülkelerde olduğu gibi, hangilerinin konuşulamayacağına işaret ederler. Böylece resmi işlemlerin hangi dilde yapılıp, yapılamayacağını eğitimde ve basında dillerin yerinin ne olacağını belirlerler.

Ulus ve Dil

Bir ülkede yaşayan vatandaşlar, yaşadıkları ülkenin kullandığı ulusal dilde yetkinlik kazanmazlarsa bu durum öncelikle vatandaşların yaşam alanlarının sınırlanmasına, daha sonra da o ülkenin politik, ekonomik, kültürel ve dil yönünden bölünmesine ve hatta dünya üzerinden kaybolmasına kadar yol açabilir. Ulusal dilin korunması ile ilgili alınacak tedbirler, ulusal ekonomilerin ve insanın sosyal refahının korunmasından ayrı olarak düşünülemez (Bilgen, 2).

Benzersiz bir ulusal dil ülke bağımsızlığının ve ülke bütünlüğünün temel, öncelikli ve en önemli güvencesidir (Sadoğlu, 2003, 28).

Bir ulusun gerçek kimliğini en iyi şekilde sanat ve bilim yapıtlarında işlenmiş olan dil ifade eder ve dil ulusun karakterini en açık şekilde ortaya çıkarır. Dilin hem yabancılaştırma hem de

birleştirme etkisi bulunmaktadır. Uluslar dil sayesinde bilinçlenmişler ve bilgileri dil sayesinde anlaşılır bir hale getirmişlerdir. Ulusların karakterleri dil sayesinde, törelerde ve gelenek göreneklerde olduğundan daha iyi anlaşılmaktadır. Ancak ulusların özelliklerini dillerin özelliklerinden çıkarmak mümkün olmaz; dünya görüşlerinin ortaya konduğu edebiyatları ve konuşma dilleri sayesinde ortaya konabilir. Dillerdeki çeşitlilik, dildeki unsur, gösterge ve seslerin farklı olmasından değil, dünya görüşlerinin farklı olmasından kaynaklanmaktadır. Her dil farklı bir dünya görüşünü yansıttığı için yabancı bir dilin öğrenilmesi insana farklı bir dünya görüşü kazandırır (Akarsu, 1998, 74).

Bir ulusun tarihi hakkında en gerçekçi bilgi veren unsur o ulusun sahip olduğu dildir. Yasalarda, dinde ve geleneklerde çoğu zaman değişiklik olabildiği halde dil genel olarak aynı kalmaktadır (Akarsu, 1998, 74).

Devlet dili olması, dillerin etkin ve yaygın bir dil olabilmesi için çok önemli bir ölçüdür. Bu anlamda Türklerin tarihsel süreçte kurduğu bütün devletlerde devlet dili Türkçe olmuştur. Dünyada var olan pek çok dilden, aralarında Türkçenin de bulunduğu sadece 118 dil, günümüze kadar "devlet dili" olabilme şansına sahip olmuştur. Tarihte büyük bir devlet olan Hun İmparatorluğu'ndan başlamak üzere, gerek Doğu, gerekse Batı Türkleri arasında Türkçe her zaman devlet dili olarak kullanılagelmiştir. Devlet dili olması nedeniyle Türkçe; Doğu Avrupa, Balkan ve Yakın Doğu dillerinin sözcük haznesine geniş ölçüde girmiş ve bölgesel dil özelliğini kazanmıştır (Dilaçar, 1962, 6).

Dil politikalarının en önemli özelliği bilinçli ve planlı gerçekleştirilmeleridir. Devletler, meşruiyet kazanmak, nüfuslarını artırmak, millî bir kimlik oluşturmak ve bunu pekiştirmek, vatandaşın katılımını sağlamak ya da kısıtlamak ve gelir dağılımını belirlemek gibi bazı amaçlarla halkın kullandığı dili etki altına almak isterler. İzlenen dil politikaları devletin çeşitli alanlarda izlemiş olduğu politikalardan etkilenir. Örneğin küreselleşme ya da diğer taraftan kökene dönme, modernleşme politikaları dil politikalarını doğrudan etkileyebilir. Dil politikaları azınlık dillerine yönelik gerçekleştirilen politikalar olarak algılanmamalıdır. Resmî ya da toplumun çoğunluğuna mensup dilin kimlikle ilişkilendirilmesi, bazı yabancı dillerin öğretmesi, yabancı dille eğitim gibi bazı dil konuları da dil politikalarının kapsamında yer alır (Açık, 2014, 596).

Türklerin dünya üzerinde yaşam sürdürdükleri alanların genişliği ve birçok milletle yaşadıkları

kültür alışverişi nedeniyle Türkçe, kendisi ile menşe bakımından yakınlığı olan veya olmayan pek çok dille temasa geçmiştir. Bu temaslar sonucunda Türkçe ile diğer diller arasında farklı etkileşimler ortaya çıkarmıştır. Kimi zaman bu dillere sözcükler vermiş kimi zaman da diğer dillerden sözcükler almıştır. Türkler tarihsel dönemlerinin başlangıcında bugünkü Moğol, Mançu ve Tunguzların atalarıyla, güneyde Çinlilerle, batıda Fin-Ugorlarla ilişki kurmuşlardır. Sonraları batıya ve güneybatıya doğru göçen Türkler; Hint, İran ve Bizanslılarla temas kurmuşlar ve bu medeniyetlerle uzun yıllar etkileşim halinde bulunmuşlardır. İslamiyet'i kabul etmeleriyle birlikte Arap ve İranlılarla sıkı ilişki içine girmişlerdir.

Arapça ve Farsçadan birçok sözcük Türkçeye geçmiştir. Diğer yandan Türkçe, Slav, Sanskrit ve Çinceden kelime almıştır (Özyetgin, 2006, 2).

"Osmanlıca" deyimi, Osmanlıcılık politikasının resmî bir ideoloji olarak uygulandığı Tanzimat'la birlikte ortaya çıkan kavramlardandır. Tanzimat aydınları siyasal birliği ifade etmek için "Millet-i Osmani" deyimini, yine konuşulan ve yazılan dili ifade etmek için ise "Lisan-ı Osmani" deyimini kullanmışlardır. Tanzimat'a kadar "Lisan-ı Türki" veya "Zeban-ı Türki" kavramları kullanılmış, Tanzimat'la birlikte "Lisan-ı Osmani", "Zeban-ı Osmani" daha sonra da "Osmanlıca" kavramları kullanılmıştır (Sadoğlu, 2003, 63). Osmanlıca; oluşturulmaya çalışılan çok parçalı Osmanlı milleti gibi "Türkçe, Arapça ve Farsçadan mürekkep bir lisan" olarak ifade edilmiştir (Levend, 2010, 11).

Tanzimat'ın ilanı sırasında Paris'te çıkarılan Le Sieclê gazetesi, 9 Kasım 1839 tarihli sayısında, Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nun yaptığı reformların başarılı olabilmesi için konuşma dilinin yazı diliyle birbirine yakın olması gerektiğini vurgulamıştır. Fakat Gülhane Hatt-ı Hümayûnu sadece Osmanlı seçkinlerinin anlayacağı şekilde ağır bir Osmanlıca ve dönemin diplomatik dili olan Fransızca ile yazılmıştı. Taşradaki Türkler bile fermanın içeriğini anlamakta zorluk çekmişlerdir. Diğer unsurlar ise, fermanın kendi dillerine çevrilmesi için bir süre daha beklemek zorunda kalmışlardır (Sadoğlu, 2003, 63). Tanzimat döneminde, ulusal bir dilin oluşturulması için etkin bir devlet politikası ortaya konulamamıştır. Bir ulus dili oluşturmanın önündeki en önemli engeller sınıf lehçeleri, taşra ağızları ve diğer azınlık dilleridir. Osmanlı'da Meşrutiyet'e kadar ne azınlık dilleri, ne de taşra ağızları ciddi bir konu olarak algılanmıştır. Tanzimat aydını için temel dil sorunu, konuşma dili ile yazı dilini birbirine yaklaştırmak olmuştur. Bir anlamda, "üst değişke" konumundaki saray ve konuşma dilinden halk tarafından anlaşılmayan Arapça ve Farsça sözcüklerin temizlenerek, alt ve üst değişkenin birleştirilmesi

hedeflenmiştir (İmer, 1998, 153).

Türkçenin öğrenim dili olarak kullanılması 1773'te Deniz Harp Okulu'nun açılmasıyla başlamıştır. Bu okulu Fransız Baron de Tott ve Cezayirli Hasan Efendi birlikte kurmuştur. Baron de Tott Türkçe öğrenmiş ve derslerini Türkçe vermiştir. İngilizce ve İtalyanca dillerini bilen Cezayirli Hasan Efendi de gemicilik konusunda bilgilerini Türkçe öğretmiştir. 1793'te açılan Kara Harp Okulu'nda (Mühendishane-i Berri-i Hümayun) öğrenimin Türkçe yapılması kararlaştırılmış, aynı zamanda ilk sınıflarda, konuşulan Türkçeyle (kaba Türkçe) öğrenim yapılacağı duyurulmuştur. Arapça, Farsça yerine, yabancı dil olarak Fransız öğretmenler tarafından öğretilen Fransızca dil derslerine yer verilmiş, batı dilleriyle yazılmış 400 kitaptan oluşan bir kitaplık da oluşturulmuştur. Ayrıca Padişah III.Selim'in askerlik bilim ve sanatı üzerine Fransızca kitapları Türkçeye tercüme ettirdiği bilinmektedir (Köksal, 2003, 140-141).

Türkçenin öneminin öne çıkarılarak bir ilim dili olması için çalışmalar II. Mahmut döneminde devam etmiştir. Bu çalışmalar özellikle 1826 yılında Yeniçeri Ocağının kaldırılmasıyla hız kazanmıştır. Ordu batı kaynaklı yöntemleri kullanmaya başlamış, bunun yanında zorunlu askerlik hizmetinin kabul edilmesi aynı zamanda modernleşmeyi gerektirmiştir. Bu nedenle ordunun eksikliklerini gidermek ve teknik eleman yetiştirmek amacıyla Kara Mühendishanesi yeni bir teşkilat yapısına kavuşturulmuştur. Öncelikle kitapların hazırlanmasıyla işe başlanmış, bu nedenle batılı kaynaklara başvurmak gerekmiştir (Karal, 1978, 51-52). Bu görev II. Mahmut devrinde Harp Okulu başöğretmenliğine getirilen Hoca İshak Efendi'ye verildi. Avrupa'da geçerli olan ilimlerden oldukça fazla haberdar olan İshak Efendi "Mecmua-ı Ulûm-u Riyaziye" adlı dört ciltlik matematik kitabını yazdı. Bu eserde matematik ve mekaniğe ait pek çok terime karşılık gelen Türkçe kelimeler verilmiş,

Türkçe'nin bilim dili olmasında önemli katkılar sağlanmıştır (Köksal, 2003, 140141).

İslamcı bir anlayışın benimsendiği II. Abdülhamit döneminde, medreseler ve Arapça eğitim öne çıkarılmıştır (Deringil, 1985, 307). Arapçanın bir bütünleşme dili olarak kullanılmak istenmesi İslami birlikteliğin sağlanmaya çalışılması olmuştur. Ancak bu durum II. Abdülhamit döneminde yeteri kadar devlet desteği bulamamıştır. Kanun-ı Esasî içinde devletin resmî dilinin Türkçe olarak belirtilmesi, çeşitlenerek çoğalan eğitim kurumları ve buralarda ağırlıklı olarak Türkçe kullanımına başlanması, diğer taraftan devlet denetimindeki basın, Türkçenin sadeleşmesini ve daha yaygın hale gelmesini sağlamıştır (Sadoğlu, 2003, 90).

Türk Dili Meşrutiyet döneminde, Tanzimat döneminde olduğu gibi özellikle yeni açılan eğitim kurumlarında yaygın olarak kullanılmıştır. Ancak bu türden okullar Tanzimat döneminde çok fazla değildi. Meşrutiyet döneminde Türkçe eğitim yapan kurumların oldukça fazla oluşu Türkçenin sadeleşmesi ve daha belirgin bir şekilde yerleşmesine imkân vermiştir (Kodaman, 1988, 89).

Öte yandan gayrimüslim ve yabancı okulların sayıları da bu dönemde artmıştır. Tanzimat döneminden itibaren açılan İbtidaiyeler, Rüşdiyeler ve İdadiler Türklerin bulunduğu ve Türkçenin konuşulduğu bölgeler haricinde ülke topraklarının geneline yayılarak eğitim-öğretim yapabilen okullar olamamıştır. Bununla birlikte 1869'da yayınlanan Maarifi Umumiye Nizamnamesine göre, ülke toprakları dâhilinde yer alan tüm ilköğretim okullarında Türkçe zorunlu tutulduğu halde, gayrimüslim okullar bu uygulamanın dışında bırakılmıştır (Ortaylı, 2010, 169).

II. Abdülhamit döneminde ele alınan dil sorunları, tüm tebaanı belli noktalarda buluşturmanın yanında, II. Meşrutiyet'ten sonra yoğunlaşan "HalkçıTürkçü" yaklaşımın bu dönemde de kendisini hissettirmesine neden olmuştur. Bu konudaki en önemli emir Abdülhamit tarafından okullara gönderilen genelgedir (Sadoğlu, 2003, 95).

19 Mayıs 1894 tarihli genelge, II. Abdülhamit'in Türk Dili ile ilgili olarak sergilenen tavır açısından önemli bir yer tutmuştur. Çünkü Kanun-ı Esasî hazırlanırken resmî dilin Arapça olması konusunda görüş bildiren Abdülhamit, yirmi yıllık bir sürenin ardından, okullarda yapılacak eğitimin Arapça ve Farsça kelime ve yapılardan uzak, sade bir Türkçe ile gerçekleştirilmesini emretmiştir. Genelgede bu doğrultuda; Rüşdiye ve İdadiye öğretmenlerinin derslerde halkın kullandığı Türkçeyle eğitim vermeleri istenmiştir. Genelgede şu hususlar ön plana çıkmıştır (akt. Köprülü, 1999, 313-315):

 1- Mümkün olduğu kadar Türkçe kelimeler kullanılacaktır.

2- Osmanlı müellifleri, maksat ve meramlarının kolayca anlaşılması yoluna gitmeyip, ne kadar çok Arab ve Faris kelime bildiklerini göstermeyi marifet sanmış, mesela lisanımızda 'taş' sözü varken, onun yerine pek çok kimsenin meçhulü olan 'senk' veya 'hacer' kelimelerini kullanmayı zarafete daha uygun zannetmişlerdir. Bu hal, birçok zararı ile birlikte dilimizde mevcut olan çok sayıda Türkçe kelimenin terkine ve unutulmasına sebep olmuştur.

3-Yazı dili için İstanbul ahalisinin konuştuğu lisanın esas tutulması, cümleler gayet sade ve açık

yazılarak kullanılan kelimelerin mümkün olduğu kadar Türkçe sözler olması herhalde çok faydalıdır".

Öğretmenlerin yapacağı görevin; eski yöntemin terk edilerek öğrencilere okuma yazma öğretilirken açık ve anlaşılır anlatımların kullanılması olarak ifade edilmiştir (Köprülü, 1999, 313-315).

Cumhuriyetten önce, 1876 Anayasası'nın 18. maddesinde "Tebaai Osmaniye'nin hidemati devlette istihdam olunmak için devletin lisanı resmîsi olan Türkçeyi bilmeleri şarttır" ifadesi devletin dilinin Türkçe olduğunu işaret etmiş ancak, bu anayasada kullanılan hâkim dil, Arapça, Farsça ya da bunlardan türetilmiş Osmanlıca sözcüklerden oluşmuştur. Bu maddede dahi; tebaa (uyruk), hidemat (hizmetler, görevler, işler), istihdam (görevde, işte, hizmette kullanma, çalıştırma), lisan (dil), şart (koşul) gibi yabancı sözcükler kullanılmış, ayrıca yabancı dil kurallarına göre düzenlenmiş olan tamlamaya yer verilmiştir. Bu kullanımlar, Anayasa'da yer alan "devletin resmî dili Türkçedir" deyiminin bile yetersiz kaldığının bir göstergesidir (Kili, 2001, 228).

Cumhuriyet'in ilanıyla birlikte, Türkiye Cumhuriyeti çağdaş uygarlık düzeyine ulaştırmayı amaçlayan devlet, Türkçeyi de bütün kültürel ihtiyaçları karşılayabilecek şekilde bir kültür dili durumuna getirmeyi hedeflemiştir. Bu niyet, haliyle planlı ve programlı bir dil politikasının uygulanmasını da gerektirmiştir. Dil Devrimi, ulusal bir dil politikasının sonucu olarak ortaya çıkmıştır. Bu nedenle Dil Devrimi'nin dayandığı temel düşünce temeli ile devletin temel yapısını oluşturan ulusal kültür politikası birbiriyle ilişkilidir. 12 Temmuz 1932 tarihinde kurulan Türk Dili Tetkik Cemiyeti'nin (sonraki adıyla Türk Dil Kurumu) Atatürk tarafından belirlenen Tüzük çalışmalarında amacı: "Türk Dili'nin öz güzelliğini meydana çıkarmak, onu dünya dilleri arasındaki değerine yaraşır yüksekliğe eriştirmek" olarak belirtilmiştir (Korkmaz, 2001, 296).

Dil Poltikası

Cumhuriyet dönemi kültür ve dil ve politikaları, batılılaşmayı ön plana alan köklü zihniyet değişimini ulusal birlik ve bütünlük endişeler de göz önünde bulundurularak gerçekleştirilmiştir. Cumhuriyet'in devrimci görüşü, yurttaşların ulusal kimlik birliğini Gökalp'in muhafazakâr kültürel yaklaşımından daha çok milletin muasır medeniyetin en ileri safhasındaki mevkiye çıkarılması gerektiği görüşünü taşımaktaydı. Kemalist ulusçuluk,

Gökalp'in ulusçuluk anlayışından farklı olarak kültür, medeniyetten bağımsız olarak düşünülemez ve modern esaslara göre yeniden oluşturulabilen ve eskinin yerini alabilen bir aktördür (Sadoğlu, 2003, 200).

Dilin yabancı kelime ve yapılardan arındırılması işlemi diğer milletlerinkine benzer şekilde Türkiye'de de uzun uğraşlar gerektiren bir süreç almıştır. Fakat Cumhuriyet döneminde sözcükler düzeyinde yoğunlaşılan dil devrimi, millî birtakım öngörülerle birlikte batılı değerlerin de kazanılmasına yönelik çalışmaları da kapsamıştır. Örnek olarak, alfabe değişikliğinin okuma ve yazmada sağlayacağı kolaylıklar öngörülmesine rağmen çok az kişi böyle bir değişikliğin geçmişi tasfiyeye ve batı ile kültürel bütünleşme aracı olacağını düşünmüştür (Ahmad, 1999, 100-101).

Atatürk Dil Devrimi'yle halkın konuştuğu dilden bir devlet dili, bir bilim dili meydana getirmiştir. Karma dilli Osmanlıca devlet dili olmaktan çıkarılmış, onun yerine Türkçe devlet dili yapılmıştır. Devlet dili durumuna gelen Türkçenin, Selçuklulardan sonra Osmanlılar döneminde de yüzyıllar boyunca duraksaması Cumhuriyetle birlikte yeniden hızlanmıştır. Bu yüzden Türk dil devrimi bir anlamda Osmanlıcaya karşı Türkçe'nin yeniden millî bir dil olma devridir. Halk dilinin devlet dili olması Türk devriminin en önemli unsurlarındandır. Türk Diliyle ilgili sorun da Türkçenin özleşmesi değil, olgunlaşmasıdır (Köksal, 2003, 104-105).

Atatürk'ün dil reformu 1928 yılında Latin alfabesinin kabulüyle başlamıştır. Mustafa Kemal alfabe değiştirme konusunda kararını çok önceden vermiş, batılılaşmanın Latin alfabesini kabul etmekten geçtiğini, çok daha önceden 1906 yılında Bulgar Türkolog Monolof'a verdiği bir demeçte ifade etmiştir (akt. Bingöl, 2004, 30): "Batı uygarlığına girmemize engel olan yazıyı atarak, kılık kıyafetimize kadar her şeyimizle Batılılara uymalıyız. Emin olunuz ki bunların hepsi bir gün olacaktır".

Latin harflerinin kabulünü öngören kanun teklifinde Arap alfabesinin başta eğitim-öğretim ve yayın hayatında öteden beri yarattığı sıkıntılar gerekçe gösterilmekteydi. Ayrıca yazı dilinin yeniden şekillendirilmesi için yeni alfabenin katkısının fazla olacağı umulmuştur. O kadar ki Maarif Vekili Necati Bey, alfabe devriminin en önemli amacını "yeni harflerin feyizli mahiyetinden istifade ederek lisanın bünyesine tesir etmek ve Türk Dili'nin istiklalini, genişlemesini, tabii tekâmülünü temin" etmek olarak açıklamıştır. Harf devrimi kendisinden sonra gelecek dil devriminin temel adımı olarak görülmüştür (Sadoğlu, 2003, 226).

Dil Encümeni'nin hazırladığı rapora göre, yeni alfabenin tam anlamıyla yaygınlaştırılması için, hem Encümen üyeleri hem de encümen dışında bu işle uğraşanlar yaklaşık on yıllık bir geçiş süreci öngörmüşlerdir (Levend, 2010, 401).

Öte yandan kanun, aşamalı olarak bir buçuk yıllık bir geçiş dönemini işaret etmiştir. 1 Aralık 1928'den itibaren resmî ve özel her türlü levha, ilan, reklam, sinema yazısı, gazete ve mecmuanın yeni harflerle basılması zorunluluğu getirilmiştir. Kamu kurumları, bankalar, şirketler ve dernekler ise 1 Ocak 1929'dan itibaren her türlü Türkçe işlemlerini yeni harflerle yapacaklar, fakat halk tarafından bu kurumlara yapılan müracaatlarda Arap harfleri 1 Haziran 1929'a kadar kullanılabilecekti. Bu tarihten itibaren resmî ve özel bütün zabıtlar; devletin bütün dairelerinde kullanılan kitap, kanun, talimatname, defter, cetvel gibi belgelerde yeni harflerden başka harf kullanılmayacaktı. Kanunun uygulanmasına büyük özen gösterilmiştir. Hatta 27 Aralık 1928'de İstanbul Belediyesi, tabelalarını yeni harflerle değiştirmedikleri için bazı dükkân sahiplerine ceza bile kesmiştir (Sadoğlu, 2003, 227).

Türkçenin Cumhuriyetten önce bir anlamda unutulacak duruma gelmesinin ve "kaba Türkçe" olarak ifade edilmesinin sebebi, Osmanlıda medreselerin hâkim oluşudur. Medreselerde okutulan dillerin; Arapça, Farsça ve Osmanlıca olması Türkçenin gelişmesini engellemiştir. Cumhuriyetle birlikte, Türkçe için en büyük engel olarak görülen medreselerin kaldırılması, yeni alfabenin kabulü ve okullarda halkın anlayacağı dille eğitim-öğretim yapılması, tüm okulların Millî Eğitim Bakanlığı'na bağlanmasıyla eğitimde birliğin sağlanması, dil konusunda çalışmaları da yoğunlaşmıştır. 1930 yılına gelindiğinde Sadri Maksudi tarafından, Türk Ocakları İlim ve Sanat Heyeti'nin teklifiyle "Türk Dili İçin" adlı bir kitap yazmış, Maksudi bu kitabında; Türk Dili'ni düzeltmek, yabancı sözlerden ayıklamak ve öztürkçe söz köklerinden edebî ve ilmi dil türetmek gerekliğini işlemiştir (Sadoğlu, 2003, 23).

Güneş Dil Teorisi

Güneş-Dil Teorisi; "insana kendi benliğini güneşin tanıtmış olması temel düşüncesine dayanan bir teoridir". Varsayılan bu teoriye göre insan, dış dünyasından gelen uyaranların etkisi altındadır. İnsanoğlu benliğini, kendini saran bu dış dünyadaki nesneleri tespit etmeye başladıktan sonra anlamıştır (Korkmaz, 1973, 76). Dolayısıyla ilk olarak her şeyden daha önemli saydığı varlık olarak güneşi görmüştür. Güneş, öncelikle görünüşü, daha sonra saçtığı ışık ve etrafa verdiği aydınlık ve parlaklığıyla, yüksekliği, zamanı belirleyişi, hareketi,

sürekliliği gibi kendisine yüklenen özellikleri dolayısıyla insanoğlunun kafasında farklı ve çok yönlü bir nesne olarak yer etmiştir. Bu nedenle insanlar başlangıçta ateş, su, toprak, büyüklük, küçüklük gibi maddî ve manevî kavramları birbirlerine, güneşe verdikleri ad ile ifade etmişlerdir. Bu kavramı anlatan ilk ses Türk Dili'nin kökü olan "ağ" sesidir (Akalın 2002). Zamanla, güneşin insan kafasında uyandırdığı çok yönlü kavram birbirinden ayrılmış, yeni ses ve kelimeler ile anlatılan yeni kavramlar ortaya atılmıştır. Bu nedenle bu teoriye göre; dilin bütün kök kelimeleri, bu ilk ağ köküne, insanların boğaz ve ağzı içine alan ses organları geliştikçe söyleyebildikleri ünlü ve ünsüzleri katmaları ile oluşmuştur (Korkmaz, 1973, 76).

İbadetin Türkçeleştirilmesi

İbadetin Türkçe gerçekleştirilme konusu, 1870'li yıllardan başlayarak Türkiye'nin gündemini meşgul etmiş ve bu konuda yoğun tartışmalar yaşanmıştır. Bu tartışmaların kaynağında o yıllarda batıda öne çıkarak önemli bir hâl alan milliyetçilik akımı ve ibadet dilleri de dâhil bazı Hristiyan mezheplerine yönelik yapılmış reformların etkili olduğu görülmektedir. Ancak Cumhuriyetle birlikte meydana gelen gelişmeler, konunun bu dönemde daha fazla tartışılmaya başlandığını ve çok daha fazla önem kazandığını işaret etmektedir (Aydar, 2006, 65). Bunda en büyük etken din hassasiyetleri ile ulusçuluk hareketlerinin bir arada tutulmaya çalışılmasıdır.

Tanzimat döneminin ünlü düşünürlerinden biri olan Ali Suavi, 1870'li yıllarda Ulûm gazetesinde yayınladığı "Lisân ve Hatt-ı Türki" adlı makalesinde, "Kur'an'ı Kerimi Türkçeye çevirmek ve onunla namaz kılmak mümkündür" şeklindeki ifadesiyle (Aydar, 2006, 61), daha sonra da Meşrutiyet dönemi Türkçüleri başta hutbeler olmak üzere bazı ibadetlerin Türkçe olarak yapılabileceğine ilişkin düşünceleriyle ibadet dili olarak Türkçenin kullanılabileceğine işaret etmişlerdir (Kara, 1994, 87).

Ali Suavi'nin görüşleri daha sonra II. Meşrutiyetle birlikte ortaya çıkan "Türkçülük" akımıyla da destek bulmuştur. O dönemin yazarları Türkçe'nin özleştirilmesinin gerekliliğinden ve öneminden bahsetmişlerdir. Ziya Gökalp, "Vatan" adlı şiirinde halkın camilerde yapılan ibadet ve okunan ezanın ne anlama geldiğini bilmediğini ve dolayısıyla anlayamadığını belirterek, ibadetin millî dille yapılması gerektiğini belirtmiştir (Akgün, 1980, 106).

Ziya Gökalp ve ileri gelen bazı düşünürlerin Türkçe ibadete ılımlı baktıklarına ilişkin fikirleri Cumhuriyet'le birlikte siyasal bir destek bulmuş ve dil politikaları arasında ibadet dilinin de Türkçeleştirilmesi önemli bir yer tutmuştur (Aydar, 2006, 61).

Cumhuriyet kurulmadan önce Kurtuluş Savaşı yıllarında Mustafa Kemal, ibadet dilinin Türkçeleştirilmesine yönelik reformların yapılacağını dile getirmiştir. Mart 1922'de TBMM'nin toplantı yılını açarken yaptığı konuşmada Diyanet İşleri Reisliğine hutbelerin Türkçeleştirilmesi konusunda önemli görevler düştüğünü belirterek (akt. Sadoğlu, 2003, 246): "Camilerin mukaddes minberleri halkın ruhani, ahlaki gıdalarına en ali, en feyyaz menbalardır. (...) Minberlerden halkın anlayabileceği lisanla ruh ve dimağa hitap olunmakla ehli İslam'ın vücudu canlanır, dimağı saflanır, imanı kuvvetlenir, kalbi cesaret bulur" ifadesiyle dil ile iman arasında bir ilişkinin olması gerektiğini gündeme getirmiştir.

Atatürk, Tekbir ve Ezanın Türkçeleştirilmesi çalışmaları ile ilgili olarak aralarında imam Ali Rıza Sağman'ın da bulunduğu imamlar heyetini, ezanı Türkçeye çevirmekle görevlendirmiştir. Aynı heyet tekbir ve kameti de Türkçeye çevirmiş ve onların hangi camilerde görev yapacaklarını bildirmiştir. Görevlendirmeyle, ilk Türkçe ezan, 29 Ocak 1932 tarihinde Hafız Rıfat Efendi tarafından Fatih camii minarelerinden okundu ve Kur'an'dan okunan tekbir, hutbe ve ezan tamamıyla Türkçeleştirilmiştir. Arkasından Şubat ayında gelen bayram günü camilerde tekbir, hutbe ve ezan Türkçe olarak okunmuştur (Aydar, 2007, 90).

Cumhuriyet döneminde, hutbe ve ezandan sonra Kur'an çevirileri önemli bir yer teşkil etmiştir. Kur'an çevirisinin ibadetlerde esas alınacağı ihtimali, birçok kesimi rahatsız etmiştir. Bu konuda Abdullah Azmi Efendi ve arkadaşlarının Kur'an'ın Türkçeye tercüme önerisi TBMM tarafından kabul edilmiş, tercüme işi Mehmed Akif'e verilmiştir. Mehmed Akif, bir süre sonra aldığı ücreti de iade ederek, yaptığı iddia edilen tercümeyi yetkililere teslim etmemiştir. Bunun üzerine Kur'an'ın Türkçeye tercümesi ve tefsiri Hamdi Yazır'a yaptırılmış, Hak Dini Kur'an Dili adıyla çıkarılan çalışma oldukça geç yayınlanmıştır (Sadoğlu, 2003, 267-268).

Ezanın Türkçe okunmasına karşı tepkiler de olmuştur. Bu tepkilerden en önemlisi ile 1 Şubat 1933'te Bursa'da yaşanmıştır. Ulucami önünde toplanan bir grup öncelikle Türkçe ezanı protesto etmiş, ardından Evkaf Müdürlüğü'ne yürümüştür. Olayların büyümesiyle Atatürk Bursa'ya gelerek olayı gerçekleştiren elebaşlarını tutuklatmıştır. Ayrıca verdiği bir beyanatta meselenin mahiyetinin esasen din değil, dil olduğunu Türk milletinin millî dili ve benliğinin bütün hayata hâkim olduğunu belirtmiştir (Gez, 1996, 163).

Kur'an'ın, ezanın ve ibadetlerin Türkçeleştirilmesi ile ilgili yasalar çıkarılmasına, bu yasalara uymak zorunlu hale getirilmiş ve uymayanların cezalandırılacağı belirtilmiş olmasına rağmen

yine de bu konuda çok başarılı olunamamıştır. Düzenleyici ifadelere karşın camide namazlar yine Arapça olarak kılınmaya devam edilmiştir. Hükûmet de namazların Türkçe kılınması konusunda çok ısrarcı olmamıştır. Ancak ezan konusunda daha katı davranılmış, güvenlik kuvvetleri de bu duruma müdahil edilmiştir. Köylerde ve kasabalarda dahi ezan Türkçe okutulmuştur. Türkçe ezan uygulaması 1950 yılında son bulmuş ve yeniden Arapça aslı ile okunmaya başlanmıştır (Aydar, 2007, 102).

İbadet dilinin Türkçeleştirilmesine ilişkin uygulama; ezan, kamet ve hutbelerle sınırlı kalmış ve namazın Türkçeleştirilmesi uygulanmamıştır. Diğer uygulamalar mevcut haliyle 1950'ye kadar devam etmiştir. Diğer taraftan Müslümanlık dışındaki dinlerde gönüllü Türkçe uygulamalar gözlenmiştir. Örneğin, Türk Ortodoksları reisi Papa Eftim, 2 Nisan 1933'te Galata'daki kilisede Türkçe ayin yaptırmıştır. Benzer şekilde Musevi yurttaşların kurduğu Türk Kültür Birliği de, 3 Ekim 1940 tarihinde havralardaki dinsel törenlerde Türkçenin kullanılması kararını almıştır (Sadoğlu, 2003, 275).

Demokrat Parti'nin, TDK'nin dilde gerçekleştirdiği özleştirme çalışmalarını zayıflatmak amacıyla izlediği yöntemlerden bir diğeri de, genel bütçeden dil çalışmaları için her yıl düzenli olarak TDK'ye aktarılan ödeneğin iyice azaltılıp daha sonra kaldırılması olmuştur. TDK'ye bütçeden ayrılan ödenek önce 50.000 TL'den 10.000 TL'ye düşürülmüş, daha sonra ise tamamen ortadan kaldırılmıştır. Gerekçe olarak, "TDK'nin bilimsel kimliğini yitirmesi, günlük politik oyunların bir aleti olması ve millî dile bilinçli olarak verdiği zarar" gösterilmiştir. Böylece daha önce hükûmetlerce TDK'ye ve yapılan çalışmalara yönelik verilen ekonomik ve resmî destek kesilmiştir (Bingöl, 2004, 42).

Anayasa dilinin değiştirilmesinde en etkili isimlerden biri Fuad Köprülü olmuştur. Fuad Köprülü verdiği önerge gerekçesinde, 1945'ten sonra yaratılmak istenen resmî dilin, kuşaklar arasındaki bağları kopararak dilde ikilik ve karışıklık meydana getirdiğini savunmuştur. Türk Ocakları'nın önde gelen isimlerinden Hamdullah Suphi kendi ana diliyle alay edercesine dili küçümsemiştir. Türkçeyi, deyiş zenginliği olmadığı düşüncesiyle kullanmamıştır. Tasarıyı hazırlayanlardan bir diğer isim ise Halide Edip Adıvar olmuştur (Korkmaz, 1963, 73-76).

Öte yandan bu dönemde Ezanın Arapça Okunma Yasağının (16 Haziran 1950) sonlandırılması da sağlanmıştır. Diğer yandan Anayasanın yazılışında Türk Dil Kurumu'nca öztürkçe kullanılarak oluşturulan maddeler, 8 Aralık 1952'de çıkarılan yasayla tekrar Osmanlıca şekline

dönüştürülmüştür. Böylece 1945 yılında Türkçeleştirilmiş olan Anayasa, 1952 yılında yeniden eski durumuna getirilerek Teşkilatı Esasiye'ye dönüştürülmüştür. Bu düzenleme Türk Dil Devriminin durdurulmasına yönelik olarak gerçekleştirilen siyasi bir uygulama olarak algılanmıştır (Dinç, tarihsiz, 14).

Sonuç

Araştırma üzerinden, günümüzde Türk Dil Politikası'na yön veren kuruluşların etkin bir dil politikası için izlemesi gereken yöntemler ele alınabilir. Çağın gereklerine uygun bir "Devlet Politikası" oluşturulması için, Türk Dil Kurumu'nun yeniden yapılandırılması başta olmak üzere tavsiye niteliğinde çalışma yapılabilir. Ulusal çıkarları korumanın oldukça zor olduğu çağımızda, Türkiye'nin hem ulus devlet yapısını koruması hem de Türkçenin bilim ve dünya dili olarak yaygınlaştırılması için etkin bir Devlet Politikasının nasıl olması gerektiği değerlendirilebilir. Türkiye'deki azınlıkta olan milletlerin dili daha geniş çapta medya ve yayında yer alabilir. Türkiye yüzyıllar boyunca hep göç alan ve geçiş ülkesi olduğu için çeşitli medeniyetler mevcuttur. Her medeniyetin kendi dili var olduğunu esas alırsak, dil bakımından zengin bir ülke olarak karşımıza çıkmaktadır. Bu dilleri en iyi şekilde kullanıma sunmak ta bir o kadar önem arz etmektedir. Türkçe başta olmak üzere, diğer azınlıkların dilleri yan dil olarak toplumda kendi yerini alabilmesi için çalışmalar yapılmalıdır.

Kaynakça

- BAYRAKTAR, Nesrin, (2006), Dil Bilimi, Ankara: Nobel Yayınları.
- BAYRAKTAR, Nesrin, (2008), "Dil Bilimci Ve Dil Eğitimcisi Olarak Kâşgarlı Mahmud", Akademik Araştırmalar Dergisi, (2008-2009), S.39, ss.131-140.
- BELGE, Murat, (Tarihsiz), "Türkçe Sorunu", Çukurova Üniversitesi Türkoloji Araştırmaları Merkezi, http://turkoloji.cu.edu.tr/GENEL/24.php
- BİÇER, Nurşat, (2012) "Hunlardan Günümüze Yabancılara Türkçe Öğretimi", Uluslararası Türkçe Edebiyat Kültür Eğitim Dergisi, S.4, ss.107-199.
- BİLGEN, Semih, (Tarihsiz), "Ulusal Dilde Eğitim", http://www.eee.metu.edu.tr/bilgen/Ulusal%20Dilde%20Egitim.pdf, [08.11.2010].
- BİLGİÇ, Beyhan Seçkin, (2004), Türkçenin İncelikleri, Ankara: Emniyet Genel Müdürlüğü Yayınları.
- KÖKSAL, Aydın, (2003), Dil İle Ekin, İstanbul: Toroslu Kitaplığı.

- KÖPRÜLÜ, Fuad, (1999), Edebiyat Araştırmaları, Ankara: TTK Yayınları.
- KUSHNER, David, (1979), Türk Milliyetçiliğinin Doğuşu (1876-1908), (çev. Rekin Ertem, Fahri Erdem, Şevket Serdar), İstanbul: Kervan Yayınları.
- LEVEND, Agah Sırrı,(1965), Ali Şir Nevaî, Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu Yayını.
- LEVEND, Agah Sırrı, (2010), Türk Dilinde Gelişme ve Sadeleşme Evreleri, Ankara: Türk Dil Derneği. ZYETGİN, Melek, (2006), "Tarihten Bugüne Türk Dili Alanı", http://turkoloji.cu.edu.tr/ESKI%20TURK%20DILI/ozyetgin_tarihten_bugune _turkdili.pdf, [12.10.2010].
- SADOĞLU, Hüseyin, (2003), Türkiye'de Ulusçuluk ve Dil Politikaları, İstanbul: Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları.
- SADOĞLU, Hüseyin, (2007), "Dil Politikaları", Necmiye Alpay ile Röportaj, Radikal Gazetesi, 24 Mayıs 2007, http://www.radikal.com.tr/haber.php?haberno=222103, [12.05.2010].
- SAKALLI, Erol, (2010), "Avrupa Dil Pasaportu ve Türkçe Öğretimi", III. Uluslararası Dünya Dili Türkçe Sempozyumu Bildiri Kitabı, (ed. İlyas Yazar), ss. 785-788, İzmir: Dokuz Eylül Üniversitesi.
- SAKAOĞLU, Necdet, (2003), Osmanlı'dan Günümüze Eğitim Tarihi, İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları. SADOĞLU, Hüseyin, (2003), Türkiye'de Ulusçuluk ve Dil Politikaları, İstanbul: Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları.
- SADOĞLU, Hüseyin, (2007), "Dil Politikaları", Necmiye Alpay ile Röportaj, Radikal Gazetesi, 24 Mayıs 2007, http://www.radikal.com.tr/haber.php?haberno=222103, [12.05.2010].
- SAKALLI, Erol, (2010), "Avrupa Dil Pasaportu ve Türkçe Öğretimi", III.
- Uluslararası Dünya Dili Türkçe Sempozyumu Bildiri Kitabı, (ed. İlyas Yazar), ss. 785-788, İzmir: Dokuz Eylül Üniversitesi.
- SAKAOĞLU, Necdet, (2003), Osmanlı'dan Günümüze Eğitim Tarihi, İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları.

Socio-Cultural Structures and Implementation of Women's Rights in Northern Iraq- The Case of Erbil City

Goran Hasan Hussein[1]

Abstract

Theoretically, human rights are rights inherent to all human beings, regardless of sex, religion, language, color, race, nationality, ethnicity, or any other status in society. Human rights are universal irrespective of the status of people and where they live. Many countries have recognized the Universal Declaration of Human Rights in their constitutions; however, many difficulties arise in their implementation due to the fact that the implementation of human rights has strong relevance to socio-cultural structures.

The main aim of this study is to determine the effects of socio-cultural conditions on the implementation of women's rights and to investigate the rights of women living in northern Iraq. In the study, the qualitative method is considered the best choice. The population of this study have been selected from women who live in different places in the city center of Erbil and countryside of the city. The purposive sampling method is considered as the best sample choice for this research in the study. Furthermore, the collection of the data achieved by semi-structured interviews and the ZOOM platform has been used to interview the participants. After the findings examined the results of the study determined with some socio-cultural factors such as tribal reconciliation, making second up to fourth wife outside of Northern Iraq, staying silence against violence especially sexual abuse and harassment, and honor killings, which become barriers for implementing, improving, and protecting women's rights in the region.

Keywords: Women's Rights, Human Rights, Northern Iraq, Socio-Cultural Structure

---

[1] Salahaddin University, College of Arts, Department of Sociology. Erbil - Iraq.

Introduction

According to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, human rights are defined as the rights that all people have without any discrimination, that is, just because they are human. In other words, all people are based on gender, race, ethnicity, nationality, religion, language, etc. without distinction, they are equal before the law no matter what. In this context, human rights are universally defined by the United Nations and encompass all innate rights, including the right to life, liberty, freedom from torture, freedom of opinion and expression, the right to work and education, and more (UDHR, Article 1). Human rights are universal; in fact, the rights referred to as women's rights are the rights of all human beings without discrimination against men as well as women. According to this view, there are no "women's human rights". The rights that exist are human rights. In other words, there should be no distinction between male human rights and female human rights (Beitz, 2009). On the other hand, when the views based on human rights are examined, it is seen that these views are not the common product of the cultures in which all people are represented, on the contrary, they are quite dominant in the emergence of a certain culture. In other words, contrary to this claim, the justifications for the "universality" of human rights are largely local. (Pekel, 2019).

In social sciences, especially in sociology, the reasons for human rights violations are commitment to social, political, economic, and cultural situations (Burton, 2014) In other words, even if international human rights conventions are recognized by legal laws; the implementation of the rights are influenced by the prevailing socio-cultural structures in the society. The development and implementation of human rights in every society depends on many factors because human rights themes are influenced by the cultural, social, political, and economic factors to which the individual is subject. Therefore, the subject of fundamental rights encounters different problems according to the culture. In society, culture has serious effects on individual behavior, so women's rights are also shaped by culture. This means that culture decides what rights should be given to women and men. In this direction, the cultural structure that hinders the development and expansion of the rights of women living in northern Iraq has been tried to be examined in this study. In this context, the socio-cultural obstacles in front of the implementation of women's legal laws in northern Iraq have been examined.

Demographic Information of the Participants

In this study, the data was collected from different levels of family, education, occupation, and

social status. Those who have faced social, economic, and political violations. We believe that these variety of participants are a good sample who could express their experience and problems freely and comfortably. 12 of the participants live in the city center and 8 of them live in the countryside of the city. The participants' age is between 23 to 45, with an average of 31. 11 of the participants are unmarried, 8 of them are married with 1 divorced. 7 of the participants are teachers, 4 of them are working at NGOs, 2 of the participants are self-employed, 5 of the participants consist of journalist, master student, medical doctor, employer and houseworker. 2 of them are unemployed. According to the education level of the participants, 16 of them have bachelor's degrees, 3 have master's degrees and 1 has a doctoral degree. The income of the participants varies according to their education level, that is, The higher the education level, the higher the income.

Methodology Of Research

This study is a qualitative research to have in-depth details about socio-cultural factors, which are barriers to women's rights, also to understand the correlation between factors. In this context, semi-structured interviews are used. The study's interviewees included a variety of respondents interested in academia, journalism, the self-employed, as well as housewives. Some of them are active researchers who campaign for women's rights or fight gender-based violence. Some have experience working with civil society, women's organizations or government agencies dealing with women's rights, while others only work at home and have experience with the problems women face in daily life.

The universe (population) of the research was composed of women living in different parts of Erbil city and rural areas in the city. The minimum education level of the interviewees is undergraduate; Participants selected according to their education level. Because women at this level are more comfortable talking about their experiences and perspectives on the situation. In this context, the purposive sampling method in the study is seen as the best sample choice for our research. In the study, 20 people have been interviewed. The interview was conducted mainly with 14 participants over the Zoom platform, and 6 participants via Messenger because they had difficulty using the Zoom platform during the interview. In order to protect their identities, we haven't mentioned the participant's name, instead we used (1st participant, 2nd participant, 3rd participant...etc.). Before the interviews were conducted, the researcher

introduced himself and explained the purpose of the research and the interview; Then, the preparation time suitable for them was determined by the participants. All interviews were conducted in quiet places to avoid distractions and to have a candid conversation with the interviewees. In addition, the extra sharing made during and after the interview was used to analyze the data by taking notes. The interviews were conducted in Kurdish language, the mother tongue of the researcher and all participants.

During the data analysis process, the obtained information was analyzed with the MAXQDA software tool. MAXQDA is the ideal software program for the efficient management and systematic evaluation of the researcher's texts, documents, and all kinds of media data. It is also used as a powerful tool to develop theory and test theoretical results (MAXQDA, 2020). While analyzing the data obtained through the interview, the codes were extracted and the relationship between some codes and the correlation between some socio-cultural factors was discovered by the software program.

Aim of the Research

Women living in Iraq have faced many problems throughout history. In the literature, it is pointed out that the rate of gender inequality is high in northern Iraq. The traditional structure also greatly influences the Iraqi Constitution and the laws of personal rights. As a matter of fact, women in Northern Iraq are faced with situations that are not provided for in the UN Declaration of Human Rights. In daily life, women face domestic violence, female genital mutilation, honor killings, sexual abuse, as well as temporary marriages, Mut'a marriages and Misyar marriages. These problems mentioned in the research have been tried to be dealt with from a sociological point of view.

In this context the aim of this research is to examine the socio-cultural factors which have become the obstacles for implementation of women's recognized rights in law in northern Iraq.

Women's Rights and Legislation Problem in Northern Iraq

The development of women's rights and implementation of their rights have faced a lot of problems because of some tribal and religious strictive rules in the area. In other words, law does not bring justice by itself only if it's not applied, because law is dependent on historical situations and recognizing a right in law is not the same as realizing it in daily practice. For a

practice to be fully implemented, a new law must be implemented, for a law to be fully implemented, a series of legal and institutional reforms must be made after a new law, as well as improving the socio-cultural situation of the people and raising their awareness (Alinia, 2013). Although some of the laws in northern Iraq have been amended and they are different from the laws in other parts of Iraq, but the laws which are recognized in northern Iraq still must be a part of the Iraqi Constitution, especially in terms of gender equality and women's rights. As stated in the Iraqi Constitution *"Each region shall adopt a constitution of its own that defines the structure of powers of the region, its authorities, and the mechanisms for exercising such authorities, provided that it does not contradict this Constitution"* (Iraqi Constitution, 2005, Article 120). As we mentioned, although the laws in northern Iraq are better than the Iraqi Constitution (at least on paper) in terms of granting women rights, there are still some articles in the law and personal laws that pose major obstacles to the promotion of women's rights, according to academics.

According to Ali's research, gender discrimination in northern Iraq, such as Article 128 of the Iraqi Penal Code, which gives light sentences to murder committed in the name of honor, and the Personal Status Law, which includes women's rights in marriage; Some changes have been made in the laws on the right to protection, inheritance, and divorce (Ali, 2019). According to the newly enacted law, Article 188 of the 1959 law was amended in Northern Iraq, and a man will not be allowed to marry more than one woman unless authorized by the judge instead. However, in order to marry the second woman, it will be obligatory for the man to obtain the consent of the first wife before the judge. In other words, if a man wants to marry a second woman, then he must get permission from his first wife: *"the first wife has to agree before the court on her husband's marrying a second wife"* (KRG, 2008, Personal Statue Law, Article 1-A).

There are many contradictory articles in the Iraqi Constitution and the Iraqi Penal Code, and those contradictions become obstacles to the development of women's rights and gender equality. Penal Code, number 111 in 1969, There are several discriminatory articles in which the punishment for the same act is not equal for men and women. For example, it is very likely that some criminals will escape from punishment despite committing a crime; but it has been stated that it is against the principle of equality before the law, which is affirmed in Article 14 of the Constitution (Iraqi Constitution, 2005, Article 14). Those laws are also incompatible with

Article 29 of the Constitution; because, according to article 29, the family, which is the foundation of society, is protected by the state (Iraqi Constitution, 2005, Article 29). The most important part, probably, protects the family institution from all kinds of violence, as in the content of paragraph 4 of the Penal Code: ***"All kinds of violence and abuse in the family, school and society are prohibited"*** (Iraqi Penal Code. 1969, Article 14). Based on the provisions of Article 14 of the Constitution, many proposals were made by the Ministry of Human Rights to amend or cancel these articles, but in addition to the weakness of state institutions, political interests, customs, and traditions also played an important role in preventing these proposals. NGOs defended a continuous campaign under the title of "Justice Law for Women's Rights" and submitted a draft to amend some of these provisions. Article 41 (1969) of the Iraqi Penal Code, which is against women's rights, allows a man to discipline his wife, and this behavior can lead to abuse and harm emotionally or physically to these women's social status, family, community, and workplace (Iraqi Penal Code, 1969, Article 41). Although this law was amended by northern Iraq's government, there have been a large number of unreported cases involving women who were beaten by their husbands and who were unable to benefit from laws that advocated women's rights. For example, according to a report prepared by the WARVIN organization in northern Iraq, 42% of women experience violence from their husbands, despite giving their reports to the police, the women's complaints were not considered, and the remaining women rarely believed in the law in northern Iraq. (WARVIN, 2013).

Another problem with the law that violates women's rights is the title of "Legal excuses and legal mitigating conditions" in the fifth chapter of the Iraqi Penal Code, which encourages the killing of women in the name of honor. In Articles 128, 130 and 132, the husband's murder on the excuse of 'honor' is based on mitigating conditions, with the perpetrator's sentence being sentenced to 6 months in most cases (Iraqi Penal Code, 1969, Article 128, 130 and 132). In other words, according to these articles, if a man kills a woman in the name of honor or on the excuse of honor, his sentence can be reduced to 6 months in prison due to extenuating circumstances. However, according to Law No. 14 of 2002 in northern Iraq, Articles 128, 130 and 132, which refer to the killing of women or men in the name of honor, will no longer be considered as a mitigating law (KRG, 2002, No. 14 Article 1). Article 409 also gives men a mitigating excuse: ***"Any person who surprises his wife in the act of adultery or finds his***

girlfriend in bed with her lover and kills them immediately or one of them or assaults one of them so that he or she dies or is left permanently disabled is punishable by a period of detention not exceeding 3 years. It is not permissible to exercise the right of legal defense against any person who uses this excuse nor do the rules of aggravating circumstance apply against him" (Iraqi Penal Code, 1969, Article 409). As such, this article constitutes discrimination against women as it is a legal excuse to reduce sentences for men who kill women in defense of their honors. Northern Iraq has passed more laws and regulations addressing gender equality than the federal government. However, although some articles of the Iraqi Penal Code have been amended by the north of Iraq, in practice, the government does not take the implementation of this amendment seriously. Also, there are always conflicts between laws and customs. Some scholars believe that the weakness of the international organization in these places is a factor in not enforcing the law (Ali, 2019). Therefore, no matter how much the laws change in Northern Iraq, violators of these changes are so common. Northern Iraq also seems to have failed to implement the law against polygamy. For example, Kurdish men will be able to travel and marry the nearest cities outside Northern Iraq's control to marry a second, third, or even fourth woman. Then the first wife will have no choice but to accept this situation as it is (Ali. 2019).

Findings and Results of The Research

According to the literature, women in Northern Iraq seem to have more rights than women in other parts of Iraq, at least on paper (legally). The government in Northern Iraq has amended some of the Iraqi Personal Laws and the Criminal Code, imposed restrictions on polygamy, made the violence committed by husband against their wives punishable, in addition eliminated extenuating circumstances that reduced the punishment of perpetrators of "horror" killings. However, there are provisions in accordance with today's world norms in Criminal and Civil Law regulations, there are serious difficulties in their implementation of the laws on women that we have identified in this research as follows:

Tribal Settlement of Murder Cases – Tribal Reconciliation:

Based on the findings of this research, it's possible to say that most of the problems related to women - especially when the problems related to the women's Honor Killings are solved outside of the court. The victim's family is persuaded by a sum of money which the

perpetrator's family or relatives take the responsibility to give the money; thus, the incident will be covered up. In other words, the victim's family will not be suing anyone. For this reason, many of the women's honor based killing cases have been kept secretly between the two families. Besides, the victim's family do not dare to reveal the case because of some sensitive issues with the cases. That's why, a few participants mentioned that the laws regulating honor crimes in Northern Iraq are not implemented effectively, and some of them mention their relatives who committed honor killings. Accordingly, most of the perpetrators have still not been legally prosecuted. Another issue observed here is that honor killing is a crime committed to clear the honor of the family. For this reason, most of the families of victims do not attempt to file a lawsuit. In cases where lawsuits are filed against criminals or suspects, the case is not conducted regularly. Sometimes the offenders are arrested but do not receive the punishment they deserve.

A woman from our relative was killed on grounds of honor, some of her close relatives also went to court, but the case did not yield any results, and no one went to jail. Still, no one knows how the case was solved. They reconciled among themselves, persuaded the aggrieved family with money (4th Participant, May 2021).

Our 7th participant, living in a district of Erbil province, who is 31 years old. She states that there are many honor-based killings in her relatives, and states that most of the cases are resolved by consensus. According to her, sometimes the police cannot find the perpetrator of the crime because the murdered woman is a close relative or because her own family is involved in the incident, no one in the family can file a lawsuit and say who the culprit is.

One of our relatives killed his own sister. His sister had a husband, but rumors had spread that she was having an affair with another man. So, her brother killed her, and the killer was arrested by police, but he was released after only one year and two months from prison. Police did not find who killed the woman, as no one clearly explained the incident to the police. Nobody said anything because the woman's family had a hand in the crime (7th Participant, May 2021).

The 15th participant has many studies on gender equality and women's rights in the region. According to her, tribal ideas dominate the justice system in the region. There are improved laws in the amended Personal Status Laws, but customary laws are still argued to be stronger than civil laws in the context of women's rights. 3rd participant agrees with 15th participant

about the impact of tribalism on law enforcement. Both focus on the sociocultural structures that shape the practice system in the region.

We have very advanced written laws, but they are not enforced. Women are killed every day and most of the cases are with members of tribes, but as I said before, those tribes have more power than written laws (3ʳᵈ Participant, May 2021).

Making Second, Third and Fourth Marriage Outside Of Northern Iraq:

In 2008, the Northern Iraq's parliament amended some of articles of the personal status act of 1959; it is made mandatory to obtain the consent of the husband's first wife before marrying a second woman, (KRG, 2008, Personal Statute Law, Article 1-A). As mentioned, polygamy laws in the region have been changed and they are more strict conditions for the benefit of women than other parts of Iraq, but still the laws are not that strong for all and in all situations. Another phenomenon mentioned by the participants in this study is that men take their second, third and fourth wives from outside in the control of Northern Iraq. Especially the cities close to the region (Mahmur, Kirkuk, Mosul, etc.). Because those cities are not under the administration of the government in Northern Iraq; This means that the government cannot decide whether the marriage is illegal or not. This is because men are legally married in the cities outside of the region for the second time, and they do not face any legal problems when they return to the regions, as they are legally married. About 95% of the participants have a second spouse in their families or relatives. 50% of this rate is one of their relatives; mentioned that his second, third or fourth wife is outside the region.

My brother-in-law married his second wife in Mahmur because it is easier to legally marry the second wife there (1ˢᵗ Participant, May 2021)

According to the 18th Participant, who has a doctorate in law, the reason for having a second and more marriages outside the region is that the conditions for polygamy laws are more difficult than in other parts of Iraq.

In the region of Northern Iraq, Iraq's polygamy law was amended, and complicating conditions were added. That's why most men go out of the region to have second, third, and fourth wives (18ᵗʰ Participant, June 2021).

As stated, polygamy is not prohibited in Northern Iraq, but there are still difficult conditions for those who want to have more than one wife. For this reason, as mentioned in the previous,

men attempt to go to outside of the region's control areas to get more than one wife. According to 10 respondents, men secretly marry their second, third and fourth wives. Sometimes their first spouse realizes this years later; but when they find out, they have no choice but to accept. 1st participant has 3 children, she has been married for 10 years. Her husband continued his marriage with his second wife for 7 years without informing his wife. It's been only a year since she has found out that her husband has one more wife. After 7 years I realized that my husband has had one more wife. I realized it myself, he didn't even tell me. Not only me, but the husband of a friend of mine got married to two more women without informing his wife (1st Participant, May 2021). A man from our relatives already had a wife and went to Mosul to be with another woman. His first wife didn't know about it. The family of his second wife sued the man, the man was arrested due to some social problems between them, and they were all expelled. Then the news was published. Until that moment, his first wife did not know that he had another wife (7th Participant, May 2021).

My aunt's husband had an affair with another woman, then married her without my aunt's permission. Then there were problems with my aunt's family, my aunt broke up with her husband, but not legally; after a while, my aunt returned to her husband due to social stigma (10th Participant, May 2021).

Accordingly, many types of marriages which have been done secretly of their first wives are Misyar marriage[4]. Some of the participants refer to Misyar marriage as 'legitimized prostitution'. According to them, Misyar marriage is a marriage that only benefits men, and the purpose of marriage is only sexual. Some other participants state that such marriages are to exploit women. The marriage that women want is one that includes constant exchange of feelings and loyalty. Misyar marriage, which means that a person comes to them for sexual intercourse once a month or a year, is not seen as a marriage by women.

Yes, my sister's husband has four wives, the third and fourth were Misyar (13th Participants, June 2021).

---

[4] Misyar marriage is a form of marriage that allows couples to live separately but come together for sexual intercourse. When the Misyar marriage is done, the married woman does not demand alimony. In addition, the woman does not always want her husband to be with her, and the husband goes to his wife whenever he wants. One of the most important features of Misyar marriage is that it is kept secret. For this reason, the wedding ceremony is not held. Retrieved from the link: https://islamonline.net/en/misyar-marriages-a-puzzle-or-a-solution/.

My uncle was traveling between two cities on business. Then we learned that he had another wife in the city where he worked. His first wife didn't know, and neither did we (14ᵗʰ Participant, June 2021).

Staying Silent Against Violence

Women do not react to the right violation they have been subjected to, even their fears of the future cause them not to sue the perpetrators that's why they are about to be staying silent. This means women do not attempt to sue the perpetrator even if they have been violated. There are some women who are sexually harassed everyday, especially in their workplaces. The most common problem that women face at work in northern Iraq is sexual harassment. Sexual harassment is a fact that is violated not only in relation to exposed women, but also in relation to the freedom of society and basic human rights. The cultural aspects of sexual harassment can be understood from the observations and literature used in this research. Sexual harassment rates are expected to be higher in cultures that promote the objectification of women and therefore show them to be inferior to men. However, due to the sensitivity of the issue, many of the cases are not reported to the competent/relevant authorities in such societies. Thus, it is quite difficult to determine the exact figures and the true size of the problem.

I have a friend who has been subjected to sexual violence, she says that if she tells her family, she can be died, or that the simplest punishment for her is to have her freedom restricted by her family. She was in a relationship with a man who neglected her after she had sex and lost her virginity (6th Participant, May 2021).

The answers given in the interviews, it was stated that in northern Iraq where virginity is highly valued, the honor of a woman is an element that earns respect for her family, and the rates of unreported sexual crimes are quite high. Victims of sexual harassment do not disclose their trauma to the police and do not report it to anyone except their closest friends, because victims of sexual violations may be in danger of receiving negative reactions when they explain the trauma they experienced. The most traumatic thing is that the victim is accused even by her family. This may be due to the fact that families do not allow their daughters to work outside, or women are too strict during working hours; especially in cases when the victims are quite good looking in appearance. For example, according to this research physical attractiveness is more important for getting a job opportunity, those women are more likely to encounter sexual

harassment at work than others. Most women who have been sexually harassed, quit their jobs or change their careers.

I worked in many private sectors; women were exposed to a lot of sexual harassment. Such actions were carried out repeatedly by the owner or sometimes the manager. They use their position to exploit women at work. A friend of mine quit her job at an NGO because the organization's manager sexually abused her, also six of her friends decided to leave the organization (7th Participant, May 2021).

There is a veiled girl from our relatives who is beautiful in appearance and has strong communication with people. A man who liked her at work tried to kiss her many times, then she got angry and yelled at him and he left her (10th Participant, May 2021).

Honor Killings

Murder in the name of honor is still common in Erbil. About 1/3 of the participants state that one of their relatives was killed in the name of honor. Most of the time the case remains confidential, and no one knows. Sometimes the killing of women occurs indirectly. In other words, the person who claims that his family or honor has been dishonored is forcing women to commit suicide. In other words, he does not want to take responsibility for the murder because they do not want to face legal problems, and he reports that the woman killed herself after the act of suicide. According to the participants, these events are very common but generally not reported.

One of our relatives was killed in the name of honor. There were rumors that they had seen her with a man, her parents had told her not to do it again, but she continued to be in a relationship with the man; then the family killed her (3rd Participant, May 2021).

A girl from my relatives was sexually abused, her family couldn't handle it, they finally killed the girl (6th Participant, May 2021).

Two years ago, one of our relatives killed both the girl and the man who was seen with the girl (19th participant, June 2021).

Honor killings sometimes occur because of an extramarital affair between a man and a woman. Sometimes it happens because of just having a relationship between the boy and the girl. That's why women don't accept any kind of relationship because they are scared of being killed for the reason of those social stigmas. For this reason, the only relationship accepted by the

participants is the one that is very simple and level, like an 'acquaintance relationship'. Another important situation is the increase in the rate of hymen repair due to the phenomenon of honor killing. The hymen maintains its social and cultural importance in many other cultures as well as in our country. In Muslim societies, the hymen is of great importance as proof of first-time sexual intercourse. The issue of virginity is a very important issue, especially in middle eastern societies. Although some of the young people have sex before marriage, they want to have their hymens repair later, since this subject is considered taboo. This procedure is applied among women who are not married yet but have lost their virginity due to sexual intercourse, falling or any gynecological disease. According to the participants, sometimes the family requests a medical certificate from medical doctors to prove that the girl lost her virginity not because of sexual intercourse but because of falling. Virginity of girls still appears to be a strong taboo in northern Iraq. Hymen repairing is done in a very secret way because it is a new phenomenon in northern Iraq. The 11th participant who is a medical doctor in a private hospital states that a friend who is also a doctor, operated on 30 girls in this way last year. He secretly performs this surgery in order not to expose the girls to death.

I have many friends who work in private hospitals, sometimes we meet on weekends. In one of our meetings, they talked about hymen surgery. Sometimes girls want to come to the hospital and have an operation without informing their families. Sometimes they want a report from the doctor to prove that they lost their virginity for a reason other than sexual intercourse. 5 months ago, a friend of mine told me that he operated on 30 girls this way in one year (11th Participant, May 2021).

Conclusion

The barriers to not implementation of women's rights in Northern Iraq are linked to many sociocultural factors. According to this study, there is no legal excuse for promoting women's rights; Although women and men are equal before the law, the problem is that the laws regarding women are not implemented. Most of the socio-cultural problems that hinder the implementation of the law are related to out-of-court reconciliations, the fact that a man outside of northern Iraq region can marry up to four wives, and women remain silent about the violence they suffer while there are written laws to protect them, at least on the paper.

Sexual harassment related to their economic rights is a phenomenon frequently encountered by

women in their workplaces and due to the sensitivity of the issue, women cannot explain this situation to anyone. Another phenomenon that is very common in Northern Iraq and has become an obstacle to the development of women's rights is honor killings. Although honor killings generally stem from the tribal ideology that shapes many institutions in the country, it is the phenomenon that has the most impact on women's rights violations.

References

- Ali, D. A. (2019). The Struggles of the Kurdish Women's Movement in the Kurdistan Region of Iraq. Not Published Master Thesis. Lunds university, Centre for Middle Eastern Studies.

- Alinia, M. (2013). Honor and Violence Against Women in Iraqi Kurdistan. First published in 2013 by PALGRAVE MACMILLAN. in the United States—a division of St. Martin's Press LLC, 175 Fifth Avenue, New York, NY 10010.

- Anjwmani Nishtimani Kurdistan-Iraq. (2002). Yasai jimare 14 w Hamwarkrdni yasai szadani Iraqi zhmara 111y salli 1969 har yak la madakani 128, 130 w 132. (Kurdish)

- Atta, A, D. Missyar Marriages: "A Puzzle or Solution?" Islam online. https://islamonline.net/en/misyar-marriages-a-puzzle-or-a-solution/.

- Beitz, C. R. (2009). The Idea of Human Rights. Published in the United States by Oxford University Press Inc., New York.

- Burton, E. M. A Social Science of Human Rights. Published by: Sag Publication LTD. Journal of Peace Research, March 2014. Vol. 51. No.2.

- Hukumeti Haremi Kurdistan, yasayi Jmare (15) sali 2008. Yasayi Hamwari Jebajekrdini Yasai Bari Kaseti Jmare (188) w sali 1959y Hamwarkraw la Haremi Kurdistan. (Kurdish).

- Iraqi Constitution. (2005). Retrieved from the link: https://www.constituteproject.org/constitution/Iraq_2005.pdf?lang=en.

- Iraqi Penal Code. (1969). Ministry of Justice. Law No. 111 of 1969. ISN: IRQ-1969-L-57206.

- Pekel, A. (2019). İnsan Haklarının Evrenselliği ve Kültürel Görecelilik. Liberal Düşünce Dergisi, 24 (96), 111-118. DOI: 10.36484/liberal.641079.

- Unites Nations (1948). Universal Declaration of Human Rights.
- WARVIN. (2013). Twndwti Beramber be Jinan w Roli Yasa. Haremi Kurdistan. (Kurdish).

The Obstacles to Solving Air Pollution Problems in Bangkok and Chiang Mai

Sapeena Wohlong[1]

Abstract

Bangkok and Chiang Mai are cities in Thailand, the two cities have been facing the problem of air pollution for almost a decade, although these two cities have been trying to cope with this problem in the past few years, and although they have some solutions for the problem, they still could not successfully deal with it. Air pollution, specifically particulate matter 2.5 (PM2.5), brings about a different dimension of the effects on the health and the outcomes on the socioeconomic which the local people in both cities are facing. This research paper uses an in-depth interview research methodology that applies open-ended questions during the interviews to obtain data from the interviewers. I conducted two semi-structured interviews with the residents of the city of Bangkok and Chiang Mai (both cities are in Thailand) who have been experiencing the serious problem of air pollution, particularly particulate matter 2.5.

This study aims to find solutions that both the Thai government and the local people could do to cope with the air pollution problem in both Bangkok and Chiang Mai, the two cities in Thailand that are amongst the most polluted cities in the world. As a result of this research study, I apply two theoretical frameworks related to environmental problem solving, i.e., administrative rationalism and democratic pragmatism.

Keywords: Air pollution; environment; policies; ecology governance.

Discipline: Political Science and International Relations.

Introduction

Bangkok and Chiang Mai are the cities in Thailand, Bangkok is the biggest and the capital city of Thailand, it is in the center of the country, whereas Chiang Mai is in the northern part of the

---

[1]Sapeena Wohlong, Istanbul Sabahattin Zaim University Graduate Education Institute Department of Political Science and International Relations.

country, neighboring Myanmar, it is one of the biggest cities in Thailand. Because being the biggest cities in Thailand, Bangkok and Chiang Mai have been facing the problem of air pollution for almost a decade, although these two cities have been trying to cope with this problem in the past few years, and although they have some solutions for the problem, they still could not successfully deal with it. Air pollution, specifically particulate matter 2.5 (PM2.5), brings about a different dimension of the effects on the health and the outcomes on the socioeconomic which the local people in both cities are facing. PM2.5 critically affects the daily lives of the people, as for the effects on health, air pollution does not only affect the physical health of the local people, but it also affects their mental health as well. For that reason, therefore, it is indispensable to find solutions and apply them to practice, in order to solve the air pollution problem most effectively. Nevertheless, to deal with the problem of air pollution most successfully, the obstacles preventing the solutions to air pollution should be identified and this is what this study wants to accomplish. Accordingly, the research question of this study is 'what are the obstacles to solving the air pollution problem in Bangkok and Chiang Mai'. This research paper is intended to assess the hypothesis that there are some obstacles that prevent the solutions from dealing with the air pollution problem in both Bangkok and Chiang Mai in the most effective way. The paper includes a brief introduction on the problems of the air pollution in Bangkok and Chiang Mai and the barriers to solving the problem properly, followed by a background and literature review of the existing research studies on the air pollution in Bangkok and Chiang Mai. Subsequently, the research question, methodology, theoretical framework, and conclusion.

Literature Review

In Lauraine G. Et al.'s paper (1997), they emphasized how the reductions of particulate matter air pollution would be beneficial to the health of humans, their paper also concluded the outcomes of "a set of health effects and economic valuation studies conducted in Bangkok, Thailand, concerning particulate matter air pollution …" (Lauraine G. Et al., 1997, p. 1630). Even though their paper did refer to the advantages that humans could benefit from the decrease in particulate matter air pollution, nonetheless, they did not touch on the means of solving the problem of air pollution which could be done by both the local people and the government whereas this present study covers the solutions or the means to reducing air pollution problem, this paper touches on what the local people and the government could do in order to reduce air

pollution in the city.

Wanida et al. (2002) came to a conclusion that the particulate air pollution was a consequence of automobile exhaust, and although their paper did mention that the busmen, the traffic officers, and the motorcycle messengers were the highly exposed groups that could have health effects as a result of the particulate air pollution. However, they did not include the policy recommendations that the Thai government should take into consideration in order to cope with the particulate air pollution which resulted from automobile exhaust in particular. This paper contains the policy recommendations in dealing particularly with transport-related air pollution which was introduced by Mr. Yodwian, a resident of the city of Bangkok who took part in an interview for this research project.

In Kenji et al.'s research (2003), they assessed the association between "traffic-based air pollution and chronic, nonspecific respiratory symptoms among traffic policemen in Bangkok, Thailand" (Kenji et al., 2003, p. 201). They examined merely the symptoms of chronic and nonspecific respiratory diseases in the group of traffic policemen in Bangkok who are affected by the traffic-based air pollution, or in other words, they simply focused on the effects of air pollution on the health of Bangkok's traffic policemen, whereas the present research includes the possible policies which the Thai government should take into account to effectively dealing with the problems of air pollution.

Chit-Ming et al.'s paper (2008) researched on short-term effects of air pollution on the mortality of people in multiple Asian cities including Bangkok in Thailand, and the other three cities in China, i.e., Hong Kong, Shanghai, and Wuhan. Their paper touched on the health effects which are resulted from the problem of air pollution upon the residents of the four mentioned cities, however, for Thailand, they included the health effects of air pollution on the residents of Bangkok only, whilst this paper touches on the effects of air pollution on the health of the residents of Chiang Mai which is likewise one of Thailand's most affected cities from air pollution.

In Viroj's writing (2008), he examined the interconnection of the level of PM10 in Chiang Mai Province and the city's incidence of respiratory illness. The author found out that smoggy pollution as a result of fires led to the emergence of respiratory illness which is similar to what its earlier reports did. Even though their statistically significant relationship is not direct, his

paper demonstrated that PM10 could put respiratory illness at risk. Nonetheless, this writing includes the outcomes of PM2.5 that have effects on the health of people in Chiang Mai. This writing pays more attention to the effects on the health of PM2.5 rather than the health effects of PM10 because PM2.5 has smaller particles than PM10, and the smaller the particles are, the more harmful to human health they would be.

Nuntavarn and Nitaya's paper (2011) mentioned only vehicular emissions as the main source of air pollution in Bangkok but this study finds out that there are some other factors that contributed to the air pollution problem in Bangkok as well such as deforestation, lack of green spaces in the city, burnings of the garbage along with the effects of political instability and the discontinuity of the policies that prevent the city in taking actions against air pollution problem more effectively.

In Phongtape and Chalerm's article (2011), it said that the main sources of the hazes in Chiang Mai were the open burnings of the agricultural fields, wildfires, and garbage burnings. However, their article did not take other factors that worsened the hazes or air pollution problem in Chiang Mai into consideration such as the topography and geographical location of the city of Chiang Mai itself which this paper does.

Apaporn and Kraichat's study (2018), intended to anticipate the number of pneumonia cases in Thailand's northern city of Chiang Mai. In their study, they revealed some evidence that advocated the effects of air pollution problems on respiratory diseases together with its relation to the increase in the hospitalization of pneumonia cases. Their study paid particular attention to the consequences of air pollution on health effects, nevertheless, this study pays attention to the outcomes of air pollution on both health and socioeconomic effects.

Arthit et al.'s paper (2019) presented their investigation of the effects of ambient air pollution on hospital admissions for respiratory and cardiovascular diseases in Bangkok, Thailand. In their paper, they discovered the short-term outcomes of ambient air pollution concerning the risk of daily hospital admission for respiratory and cardiovascular diseases in Bangkok. However, they acquired the data on the concentration of ambient air pollution from fixed-site monitoring stations which may have a possibility that could lead to misclassification of the exposure more than the data that comes from personal exposure, whilst this paper obtains data of personal exposure from one of the interviewees who had faced severe air pollution problem

in his hometown by himself.

Daiju et al.'s paper (2019), carried out observational research on fine particulate matter (i.e. PM2.5) and acid deposition. Likewise, their paper analyzed the PM composition data to look for the main sources that contributed to PM2.5 in which they found out that the two main sources of PM2.5 are biomass burning and transportation. Their paper presented the policy actions against PM pollution in Thailand as well, along with discussed the policy implications in dealing with the serious problem of air pollution in Thailand by focusing mainly on the case of air pollution in Bangkok which is one of the most polluted cities in Thailand, whereas this paper covers the case of air pollution in both Bangkok and Chiang Mai (a city in the northern part of Thailand) which similarly faces a serious air pollution problem as Bangkok does. Furthermore, this paper focuses on the obstacles to solving air pollution problems in Bangkok and Chiang Mai to find the reasons why the air pollution problem still exists despite all the policy recommendations and some policy actions that have been implemented in both cities.

Background

Air pollution is one of the serious environmental problems which many cities in the world are currently facing, although this problem has been occurring for decades, still, a lot of cities could not cope with it properly. Air pollution itself is not only affecting the health of the people in polluted cities, but it also affects their socioeconomic ways of life, poorer countries or poorer people in those polluted cities are tended to be more vulnerable to the effects of air pollution, whereas richer countries or richer people in those cities tend to deal with the problem easier. Air pollution is a mixture of solid particles and gases in the air that can be referred to as air pollution. Particles may be suspended as a result of automobile emissions, factory chemicals, dust, pollen, and mold spores. Ozone, which is a gas by itself, is amongst the many key contributors to urban air pollution. Smog is the term given to air pollution that is caused by ozone. From 1997 up to the present time, many types of research had studied the air pollution issue in both Bangkok and Chiang Mai, however, many of these studies mainly focused on health-related issues or the diseases that resulted from air pollution. Nevertheless, few studies included solutions or policy recommendations to deal with the air pollution problem in both cities. This research paper tries to find the obstacles which prevent the solutions or the policy recommendations from solving the problem successfully.

Methodology

The research question of this research paper is 'what are the obstacles to solving the air pollution problem in Bangkok and Chiang Mai?'

For the research methodology, this study uses an in-depth interview research methodology to collect data. The author conducted two semi-structured interviews with the local people (one of the interviewees is coming from Bangkok, i.e., Mr. Sharif Yodwian, and another interviewee, with an alias name, Mr. Bang, is coming from Chiang Mai). During the interviews, the author asked the interviewees open-ended questions to get rich data, obtain as much information as possible, and understand the research problem more comprehensively. Furthermore, asking the interviewees open-ended questions, allowed the interviewees to express themselves infinitely. Accordingly, the data being collected in this research study is in a form of verbal statements from the local people who are from Bangkok and Chiang Mai, they have been facing, experiencing, and witnessing the problem of air pollution with their own eyes, hence, the obtained data in this study is authentic because the data are from the first-hand experiences of the interviewees themselves.

Discussion

In the research methodology being used in this research study, in which the author conducted two semi-structured interviews with the residents of Bangkok and Chiang Mai by asking them qualitative research questions to find the obstacles that local people perceived as the major barriers that prevent the effectiveness of the problem-solving of air pollution in the two cities. Thereby, the theoretical frameworks of this research study are related to environmental problem solving, although there are three different discourses for solving environmental problems, this study combines two distinct environmental problem-solving discourses, which include administrative rationalism and democratic pragmatism, because the purpose of this research paper is to look for the solutions that could be accomplished by both the government and the people and to search for the obstacles which the local people see as the barriers to solving the air pollution problem, and as a result of the interviews which the author conducted with the residents of Bangkok and Chiang Mai, both residents from these two cities perceived that despite the existing obstacles which preventing the effectiveness of the environmental problem solving, there needs to be a collaboration between both sides (i.e. the government side, and the citizens or the local people side). Hence, the integration between administrative rationalism and

democratic pragmatism is the best-combined theory to describe the results of the obtained data in this study.

Administrative rationalism is one of the discourses amongst environmental problem-solving discourses. This administrative rationalism discourse in which the environmental problem solving is in the hands of the experts emphasizes the role of the experts in solving the problem of air pollution more than the role of the citizens (Dryzek, 2013, p.75). In addition, this discourse has many agencies that take part in finding solutions to the air pollution problem, most of these agencies are subnational governmental units as Dryzek has said "Many subnational governmental units such as states, provinces, and cities also possess such agencies; …" (2013, p. 77). According to the data obtained from the interview the author conducted with Mr. Yodwian who is from Bangkok, he mentioned that to solve the air pollution problem in Bangkok, the government should come up with both short-term and long-term policies in dealing with the repeating problem of air pollution. Among the policies the Thai government should adopt, as referred to by Mr. Yodwian during the interview, are the odd-even policy to reduce air pollution from vehicles, the introduction of electric vehicles, and increasing numbers of green spaces in the city. Whereas Mr. Bang (alias name) who is from Chiang Mai, stated several policies which should be adopted by the government, the policies include employing controlled burning and developing a transportation system, specifically the system of public transportation in the city.

Democratic pragmatism is another discourse in solving environmental problems. This discourse places the role of environmental problem solving on the people instead of the experts. The word 'democracy' in the democratic pragmatism discourse Dryzek did not mean as a set of institutions, but rather he meant it as "a way of approaching problems" (2013, p. 99). Hereupon, the way of approaching problems in this discourse is democratic in which citizens are the main agents in finding solutions and solving the problems. As for the solutions to solve the air pollution problem which could be accomplished by the local people in Bangkok, Mr. Yodwian brought up that people could use more frequent public transportation, and plant more trees, and together try not to burn their garbage. While, for Chiang Mai, Mr. Bang introduced the local people in Chiang Mai could adopt the 'Mae Chaem Model Project' and work together with the government to solve the recurrent problem.

Conclusion

In my paper, the obstacles that have been hindering the solving of the air pollution problem in Bangkok and Chiang Mai have been analyzed from a new perspective with a lot of things considered. The main thing that motivated my work is that air pollution is no longer something we can ignore due to the many challenges that it brings, and among these are health problems. Therefore, I conducted two semi-structured interviews with Mr. Yodwian (from Bangkok), and Mr. Bang (alias name, from Chiang Mai). Out of all of the interviews and all of the research that was made, my paper presents several solutions such as the adoption of the odd-even policy, the introduction of electric vehicles, and the increase in the number of green spaces in the city of Bangkok, the controlled burn in the Chiang Mai province, the changing and developing of the transportation system, however, all of these solutions or policy recommendations need to be implemented by the Thai government. Whereas the local people of both cities could also help and support the government in solving the air pollution problem, the solutions that could be accomplished by the people that my paper has are the adoption of the Mae Chaem Model Project for the people in Chiang Mai, and their cooperation with the government, while, for Bangkok, the people in the city could use more of public transportation instead of their personal cars in order to reduce the emissions of air pollutants from the transportations, the people in Bangkok could also burn less garbages, and planting more trees. Nevertheless, even though there are several solutions and policy recommendations that could be achieved by both the Thai government and the local people of both cities have been presented here, there are still many obstacles that make these solutions and policy recommendations much more difficult to achieve, among of the obstacles that preventing the problem-solving are lacking both short-term and long-term policies in solving the air pollution problem, domestic political instability such as the changing of the regime and discontinuous policies, the problem of corruption throughout the government authorities, and the Constitution of the Kingdom of Thailand 2017. Thereby, in order to solve the problem of air pollution in both Bangkok and Chiang Mai in the most effective way, we need to remove these obstacles that interrupt the cities from effectively solving the air pollution problem first, after that, we could apply all the solutions and policies that we have to cope with the air pollution in Bangkok and Chiang Mai.

References

- Chestnut, L. G., Ostro, B. D., & Vichit-Vadakan, N. (1997). Transferability of air

pollution control health benefits estimates from the United States to developing countries: evidence from the Bangkok study. American Journal of Agricultural Economics, 79(5), 1630-1635.

- Jinsart, W., Tamura, K., Loetkamonwit, S., Thepanondh, S., Karita, K., & Yano, E. (2002). Roadside particulate air pollution in Bangkok. Journal of the Air & Waste Management Association, 52(9), 1102-1110.

- Tamura, K., Jinsart, W., Yano, E., Karita, K., & Boudoung, D. (2003). Particulate air pollution and chronic respiratory symptoms among traffic policemen in Bangkok. Archives of Environmental Health: An International Journal, 58(4), 201-207.

- Wong, C. M., Vichit-Vadakan, N., Kan, H., & Qian, Z. (2008). Public Health and Air Pollution in Asia (PAPA): a multicity study of short-term effects of air pollution on mortality. Environmental health perspectives, 116(9), 1195-1202.

- Wiwanitkit, V. (2008). PM10 in the atmosphere and incidence of respiratory illness in Chiangmai during the smoggy pollution. Stochastic Environmental Research and Risk Assessment, 22(3), 437-440.

- Vichit-Vadakan, N., & Vajanapoom, N. (2011). Health impact from air pollution in Thailand: current and future challenges. Environmental Health Perspectives, 119(5), A197-A198.

- Wiwatanadate, P., & Liwsrisakun, C. (2011). Acute effects of air pollution on peak expiratory flow rates and symptoms among asthmatic patients in Chiang Mai, Thailand. International journal of hygiene and environmental health, 214(3), 251-257.

- Ruchiraset, A., & Tantrakarnapa, K. (2018). Time series modeling of pneumonia admissions and its association with air pollution and climate variables in Chiang Mai Province, Thailand. Environmental Science and Pollution Research, 25(33), 33277-33285.

- Phosri, A., Ueda, K., Phung, V. L. H., Tawatsupa, B., Honda, A., & Takano, H. (2019). Effects of ambient air pollution on daily hospital admissions for respiratory and cardiovascular diseases in Bangkok, Thailand. Science of the total environment, 651, 1144-1153.

- Narita, D., Oanh, N. T. K., Sato, K., Huo, M., Permadi, D. A., Chi, N. N. H., ... & Pawarmart, I. (2019). Pollution characteristics and policy actions on fine particulate

matter in a growing Asian economy: The case of Bangkok Metropolitan Region. Atmosphere, 10(5), 227.

- Dryzek, J. S. (2013). The politics of the earth. Oxford university press.

Olanaklı Dünyalar Sorunu

Zainullah Nasiri[1]

Özet

İnsanlar bulunduğu şartlarda ve gerçekleştirdiği eylemlerde, en iyiyi arayarak kanaatkârlığı çoğu zaman bir tarafa bırakır. İnsanlık tarihi irdelendiğinde, iyi olma gayretinin insanın gelişimine katkı sağlayan önemli bir faktör olduğu görülmektedir. İyi olma ya da iyiyi gerçekleştirme fikri, insanın kendi aklından kaynaklı olmakla beraber yek diğer etkenler ile yapılan kıyaslar sonucu da ortaya çıkabilir. Bu süreç devam ederken her zaman daha iyisinin mümkün olduğunu düşünülür. Daha olanaklı şartlar içerisinde yaşanılabilir bir Dünya'yı hayal ederek eylemlerde bulunulur. Olanaklı Dünya, teori olarak kalmış olsa da literatürde önemli tartışmaların konusu olmuştur. Böyle bir Dünya'nın olup olmadığından ve şartlarının neler olabileceğinden söz edilmiştir. Olanaklı evren (possible World) meselesini çalışmada görebileceğimiz gibi Gottfried Leibniz, Raymond Bradley ve Norman Swartz, Arda Denkel, Robert C.Stalnaker ve M.Aurelius tarafından tartışılarak öne sürülen çeşitli fikirler de çalışmamızda yer almıştır. Leibniz, Monadoloji'sinde Monadları madde-öz (substance) olarak belirterek onların aniden var olma (come to being) ya da yok olma (come to an end all at once), farklı özellikleri bünyesinde barındırma ve son olarak Tanrının sınırsız basiretinden (İnfinite wisdom of God) kaynaklı olarak açıklanmıştır. Leibniz'e göre Tanrı iyidir ve sırf iyi olduğu için kötülük yapmaz. O nedenle olanaklı evrenleri yaratmış fakat bizim içinde bulunduğumuz evreni iyi, seçilmiş evren olarak ortaya koymuştur. Raymond Bradley ve Norman Swartz da bu konu özelinde gerçek Dünya (actual World) ifadesi ile söz etmişlerdir. Biz çalışmamızda "olanaklı dünya" sorununu detaylara inmeksizin çeşitli filozofları ele alarak tartışacağız.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Olanaklı dünya, Monad, Zaman yolculuğu, Aktüel dünya, Nesne

Giriş

Dünyanın varoluşu eski zamandan beri felsefede tartışma konusu olmuştur. Antik Yunan'da da filozoflar bu konuda çeşitli düşünceler ileri sürmüşlerdir. Kimisi varlığın temelini ya da başka bir deyişle asıl tözünü (substance) su, kimisi ateş ve yahut atom olduğunu ileri sürmüştür.

---

[1] Ondokuz Mayıs Üniversitesi, Yüksek Lisans Öğrencisi

Thales bu tartışmada öz'ü su olarak ifade etmiş her şeyin sudan var olduğunu söylemiştir. Herakleitos ise töz'ün ateş olduğunu savunmuş, teorisini karşıtlıklarla açıklayarak bunun seyrini bir döngü şeklinde devam ettiğini belirtmiştir. Töz'ün atomdan meydana geldiğini savunanlar ise ruh ve ahlakın hafif atomlardan, ağır cisimlerin ise yoğunlaşmış atomlardan meydana geldiğini belirtmiştir. Bu tartışma sadece ruhun ya da cismin oluşumu bakımından değerlendirilmekle kalmayıp, ahlak felsefesini ve hatta tanrının ispatlanması tartışmalarında da önem arz ettiği vurgulanmaktadır. Asıl tözün ne olduğu, ahlak felsefesinin esaslarıyla birlikte ele alınarak Tanrının özelliklerinin belirlenmesi ve sıfatlarının ortaya çıkarılması için önemli bir dayanak teşkil etmiştir.

Leibniz'in de özellikle bu konuda literatürde yer edinmiş teorileri bulunmaktadır. Leibniz, en iyi ilkesi (principle of the best) ya da süreklilik ilkesini (principle of continuity) açıklarken içerisinde var olduğumuz Dünya'nın en iyi Dünya olduğunu kabul etmiştir. "Tanrı başka bir dünya da yaratabilirdi, fakat bu Dünya en iyisi olarak yaratıldı" düşüncesini ileri sürmüştür. Leibniz; Monadoloji'de monadı tanımlarken de orada töz (substance) (Leibniz, 2011: 6) özellikle basit/temel töz (simple substance) (Leibniz, 2011: 6) olarak tanımlar ve ardından da parçası olmayan (without parts) (Leibniz, 2011: 6) diye bir açıklayıcı tanımlamayı getirir, monadlar'ın parçalanmazlığını ortaya koyar. Bununla alakalı Raymond Bradley ve Norman Swartz da "hakikatin olanaklarla çevrildiği" düşüncesini ileri sürerek; "Gerçeklik, adeta sonsuz bir olasılıklar alanı ile çevrilidir veya başka bir şekilde ifade edebileceğimiz gibi, gerçek dünyamız sonsuz sayıda başka olası dünyalarla çevrilidir." (Bradley and Swartz, 1988: şeklinde açıklamıştır. İkinci olarak da "Bu iddia, bizim içerisinde var olduğumuz Dünya'nın bir çok mümkün olan Dünya ile çevrilmiştir" kabulünü ileri süren bir iddiadır. Arda Denkel de Leibniz'in görüşleri doğrultusunda özdeşlik konusundaki zaman-mekan sorununu ortaya koyarak; ondan eski hipotez (ex hypothesis) olarak söz eder. Biz de bu görüşleri esas alarak konumuzu inceleyeceğiz.

Gottfried Leibniz ve Raymond Bradley / Norman Swartz
Leibniz, 17.yy filozofu, matematikçi ve kendi dönemini ortaya koyduğu teorilerle etkilemiş isimlerden biridir. Yazılı çok eseri bulunmamakla yazdığı eserlerde kendisinden önceki filozoflar ve düşünürlerin görüşlerini yeniden inşa etmiş, Aristoteles'in sebep-sonuç ilişkisi kuramına dayanan Tanrı ve düzen konusuna getirmiş olduğu açıklama ile var olan kabule

değişiklik getiren düşüncelerinden birine örnektir.

Leibniz felsefesinde olanaklı dünya (actual world - possible World) olarak ifade edilen konu önemli ölçüde açıklanmıştır. Robert C.Stalnaker bunu şöyle belirtir: "Leibniz'e göre evren/gerçek dünya, Tanrı'nın zihninde var olan sonsuz sayıda olası Dünya'dan biridir." (Stalnaker, 2012: 65). Robert C. Stalnaker burada olanaklı dünyayı Leibniz açısından açıklayarak bunu belirsiz Dünya'lar arasından seçilmiş bir tanesi olarak belirtmiştir. Tanrı başka Dünya'yı gerçek Dünya (actual World) olarak seçme gücüne sahipken, bizim içerisinde var olduğumuz Dünya'yı seçmiştir. Buna benzer bir tanımlamayı biz Aurelius'te de görürüz, şöyle ki: "Eğer tanrılar benim hakkımda bir karar verdilerse ve bu kararlar gerçekleşirse, bu onların iyi kararlar olduğunu gösterir (Bir tanrının kötü bir karar verdiğini hayal etmek güç). Neden güçlerini sana zarar vermek için harcasınlar?" (Aurelius: 63). Burada Aurelius da Leibniz ile hemfikir olduğu görülebilir. Çünkü Tanrı iyidir ve salt iyi olduğu için iyilik yapar. Bunu da yaparken kimseye muhtaç olduğundan ya da zaruret duyduğundan değil sırf kendisi öyle olduğu için bunu yapar. Mesela iyi bir adam düşünün: iyi davranan, iyi söz sarf eden, iyi geçinen ve nihayetinde tam bir iyilik abidesi olarak tasvir edilebilecek kişi. Bu adama kötü bir söz söylendiğinde şayet misliyle karşılık verirse bu sadece iyiliğin iyi olmasından kaynaklı iyilik abidesi olmaktan ziyade sadece görünüşte iyiliği sergiler ve ancak iyiliğe iyilik ile karşılık verdiği taktirde, aksi durumda kişinin içindeki kötülüğü ortaya koyabilen biridir. Fakat gerçek anlamda iyi olarak kabul edilebilecek kişi bunu iyiliğin iyi olduğu için yapar. Deyim yerinde ise iyiliğin iyilik dışında bir gayesi olamaz. O zaman Tanrı varlığı yaratırken de güzel yaratmıştır, çünkü kendisi salt iyi olduğu için kötü bir şey yaratmaz. Kötüsünü yaratabilir, fakat sırf kendi sıfatından kaynaklı olarak 'iyiyi' yaratır; bu tamamen onun gücüne bağlı bir şeydir. Tanrı iyi ise ve iyi'yi yaratırsa o zaman kötü olamaz, çünkü Leibniz'in "özdeşlik ilkesine" ters düşer. İyilik ve iyilik yapma tanrının özüne özdeş olma hali almıştır ve bunun zıddı olamaz. Ahmet Cevizci 17.yy felsefesi kitabında bu konuyu şöyle açıklamıştır: "Bu ilkeye göre, bir önermenin, onun karşıtı kendi kendisiyle çelişik olduğu zaman doğru olduğuna hükmedilir." (Cevizci: 379). Burada Tanrı'nın iyi olması kötü olması sıfatıyla çelişik durumdadır. İyilik sıfatını kabul edersek o zaman Tanrı kötü olamaz. Kötülük sıfatını kabul edersek o zaman Tanrı iyi olamaz. İyi olduğunu kabul ettiğimizde o zaman yarattığı şey de iyi ve mükemmeldir. Kötü dediğimizde, doğal olarak yarattığı şeyin kötü olmasını kabul ederiz ve iyilik beklemeyiz. Tanrının iyilik doğası, bu Dünya'yı iyi yaratması için yeterince bir neden teşkil edebilir. Leibniz

bunu yeter-sebep (Principle of sufficient Reason) diye adlandırdığımız şey olarak tanımlamıştır. Bu; o binlerce yaratmış olduğu Dünya (indefinit world) içerisinde içerisinde bulunduğumuz Dünya'yı en iyi Dünya olarak seçmesi için yeterlidir.

Diğer yandan Leibniz'in dediği gibi Tanrı monadları yarattı ve bu monadlar cismin yapıtaşları, bölünmeyen parçalar (substance) olarak adlandırılmıştır (Leibniz,1898:6). Bölünmeyen parçalar ; daha küçük parçacıklara ayrılamayan olarak ifade edilebilir. O zaman Monadlar parçalanıp bir şeyi ortaya çıkaramazlar; parçalanma yerine birleşme veya ayrışma yoluyla başka bir şeye dönüşürler. Bu birleşme ve ayrışma neticesinde ortaya çıkan yeni şey Leibniz tarafından "bileşikler" (compounds) olarak adlandırır (Leibniz, 1898:6). Yapıtaşlar (Monadlar) asıl ve sade doğasıyla bir araya gelerek daha da karmaşık bir varlığı ortaya çıkarır. Robert C.Stalnaker ise bunu "Tanrının sonsuz bilgeliği" (infinite God wisdom) olarak tanımlar (Stalnaker, 2012: 65). Eğer Monadlar Tanrı eseri ise o zaman Tanrı değildir. Tanrı mükemmel olan bir varlıktır. Mükemmeliyet de beraberinde her şeyi barındırdığına göre Monadların (substances) her biri, her şeyi ve sıfatı bünyesinde barındıramaz. Çünkü aksi ihtimalde o zaman kendileri Tanrı olurlardı. Bu konuyu Leibniz de zorunlu olarak görmüştür ve "Yine de Monadların bazı nitelikleri olmalı…" (Leibniz, 1898: 10) diyerek bu özelliklerin varolmasını zorunlu görmüştür. Bu özelliklerin zorunlu kılınması ve Monadların Tanrıdan varlığını bulması, diğer yandan Monadların mükemmel olmamaları ve Tanrının kontrolü altında olması bir kargaşayı önler. O nedenle Dünya'da kaos yerine düzen hakimdir. Peki bu Dünya yada "seçilmiş Dünya" ifadesi ile tabir ettiğimiz Dünya'dan başka Dünya var mı? Bu soruya Olanaklı Dünya teorisi özelinde vardır denilebilir. Mesela A kişisi aynı sıfat ve özellikleriyle içinde bulunduğumuz Dünya'da olabildiği gibi başka bir yerde de olabilir. Sıfatlarında ve kişiliğinde hiçbir eksilme olmaksızın varlığından söz ederek zaman yolculuğu kavramını da ihtimal olarak değerlendirip ön plana çıkarabiliriz. (A) kişisi 2021 yılından geçmişe gidebilir. Hatta geçmişe gittiğimizde bugün yapmayacağımız ya da yapamayacağımız şeyleri yapabilir. Raymond Bradley ve Norman Swartz'ın "Olanaklı Dünyalara Giriş" eserinde, bu konuyu şöyle açıklamıştır: Heinlein'in romanında yazar Heinlein romanından söz edip bu romanda Lazarus "time-travel" olayında kendi annesine aşık olduğunu belirtmiştir (Bradley ve Swartz, 1988). Bu olamaz mı? Salt mantıkla düşündüğümüzde olabilir. Neden olmasın? Tanrı varlığı Monadlardan ya da tözlerden(substance) ortaya çıkardığı gibi başka bir evren başka bir Monaddan yaratamaz mı? Yaratabiliyorsa, nasıl ki Monadları yaratmış, sadece var olması

(only come into being) (Leibniz, 1898: 8) ya da aynı şekilde ortadan kalkması (or come to an end all at once) (Leibniz, 1898: 8) gibi o zaman daha iyi bir evren da yaratabilirdi. Eğer yaratamazdı denilirse o zaman Tanrı'nın kudreti inkar edilmiş olur, fakat yaratabilirdi ama yaratmadı denildiği taktirde o zaman Tanrı'nın ihmalkar olduğunu kabul etmiş oluruz ki her iki durumda zararlı çıkan Tanrı olacaktır. Fakat buradaki sorun, yaratıp yaratamamaktan ziyade tamamen iyi- kötü sorunudur. Tanrı daha büyük bir zararı önlemek için küçük zararın olmasına razı olmuştur denilebilir. Mesela bir silahı düşünelim. Silah ile birini öldürülebilir. Aynı silah ile bir asker ülke sınırlarını koruyabilir. Öldüren silah kötüdür, çünkü birinin yaşamını son vermiştir, fakat asker elindeki koruyan silah kötü müdür? "Silahı imal eden kişiye senin silahın öldürür ve bunu yok edelim denilirse ve akabinde yok edilirse o zaman memleket korumasız kalabilir. Fakat yok etmezsek biri ölecek" fikirsel tartışmaları ardından büyük ve küçük menfaat duyarlığı ortaya çıkar.

Olanaklı dünya tartışmamızda da Raymond Bradley ve Norman Swartz'ın olanaklı Dünya'ların tanıtımında (Intorduction of possible worlds) var olmuş olan Dünya'yı (possible World) gerçek ve gerçek olmayan (actual-non-actual) olmak üzere ikiye ayırmaktadır. Şöyle ki: Hakiki dünyadan kastımız yaşadığımız Dünya değildir. Hatta bizim gezegen yahut Güneş sistemi de amaçlanmamaktadır. Hakiki Dünya denildiğinde tüm Dünyayı kastedilir. Yine hakiki Dünya'dan amaç; Dünya'nın sadece şuan ki hali kastedilmez. Böyle tanımladığımızda, varlıktan söz etmiş olur ki varlık; geçmiş, şimdiki ve geleceği kapsamaktadır. Hakiki Dünya geçmişe ve geleceğe vurgu yapmaktadır (Bradley and Swartz, 1988 : 4-5).

Görüldüğü gibi olanaklı Dünya'yı (possible World) anlamak için ilk önce gerçek Dünya (actual World) anlaşılmalıdır ki olanaklı Dünya kavranabilsin. Fakat hiç kuşkusuz bahsedilen gerçek Dünya (actual World) sadece yaşadığımız yerden ibaret değildir. Galaxy, tüm varlık ve hatta zaman sınırını aşan varlık; geçmişte, şuan ve gelecekteki varlıklardan ibarettir. Durum böyle olunca, bu gerçek Dünya (actual World) - olanaklı Dünya (possible World) olarak ortaya çıkar. Peki diğer olanaklı Dünya'ların akıbeti ne olacak? Evet Leibniz'in dediği gibi bir çok olanaklı dünya (infinite God wisdom) yaratılmıştır. Diğer olanaklı Dünya'lar, Raymond Bradley ve Norman Swartz'ın dediği gibi gerçek Dünya (actual World) olmadığını; sadece olanaklı Dünya'lar olduğunu belirterek şöyle açıklamıştır: Gördüğümüz Dünya yahut hakiki Dünya diğer olanaklı Dünya'lar arasında seçilmiştir. Halbuki olanaklı Dünya sayısı çok fazladır(Bradley and Swartz, 1988: 5) O zaman olanaklı Dünya sayısı çok fakat onlardan bir

tanesi seçilmiştir. Söz ettiğimiz Dünya'lar fiziki olarak bulunmaz yani bunlar bulunmayan/dışarıda(out there) olarak bilinir ve bunlara erişim ancak akıl (logical space) ile mümkündür. Tanrı neden başka bir Dünya yaratıp ve sonra en iyisi olarak, bütün bu olanaklı Dünya'lar (possible World) arasından bir tanesini gerçek Dünya (actual World) olarak seçsin? Hepsini iyiliklerden dolu ve seçkin olarak yaratamaz mıydı?

Arda Denkel, Leibniz ve Raymondd Bradley / Norman Swartz'ın Olanaklı Dünya Konusundaki Kıyaslaması

Arda denkel da tıpkı Raymond Bradley ve Norman Swartz'ın görüşleri gibi bir görüş ortaya koyarak nesneler için bazı niteliklerin zorunlu olmasından şöyle söz etmiştir: "Bir başka deyişle nesneler için kimi nitelikler zorunludur. Ne demektir, zorunlu olmak? Bir şeyin zorunlu olması şuan nasılsa, her zaman (geçmişte ve gelecekte de) öyle olmasıdır." (Denkel, 1985:105) Nesnelerin bazı zorunlu özellikleri içerisinde barındırması lazımır ki ona belli bir nitelik kazandırabilsin. Örneğin bir kalem düşünelim. Kalem yazma özelliği taşımalıdır lazım ki o nesneye ona kalem denilebilsin yoksa o nesne veya cisim kalem olmaktan çıkar ,başka bir nesne özelliğini taşıdığı için o nesneye dönüşür. Liebniz de bunu Monadoloji'sinde farklı özellikler (different qualities) diye adlandırırken Monadların bir özelliği taşımaları gerektiğini söyleyip şöyle ifade etmiştir: Burada Liebniz: "Monadlar bu özelliklerinden soyutlandığında yok olurlar ve hiç olamazlar diye söz ederek her Monad'ın mutlaka bir özelliği olsun ki var olabilsin aksi takdirde var olamazlar (not existing even)", (Leibniz, 1898:10) olarak tanımlamıştır. Arda Denkel de nesnelerinin nitelikleri ortaya çıkması için bazı özelliklerin taşıması gerektiğini dile getirmiştir. Diğer yandan olanaklı evrenin sayıca sonsuzluğunu dile getirerek bizim, evrenle hemen hemen özdeş olduğunu belirtmiştir. (Denkel, 1985: 105) Bu konuda da olanaklı bir çok evrenden bizim evrenimizin / Dünya'mızın seçilmiş bir Dünya olarak ortaya çıkması, netice olarak anlaşılıyor ki- bir önceki konumuzda da Robert C.Stalnaker da bunu Tanrının sınırsız basiretinden[5] (İnfinite God wisdom) kaynaklı olarak belirtmişti- nesnelerin kendi bazı özelliklerini yitirebilir veya değişime uğrayabilir olduğu fakat bu özelliklerin değişmesi, nesnenin değişmesi anlamına gelmeyeceğinin kabulü gerekir. Bizlerin içerisinde bulunduğu evrendeki bir kalemin başka bir olanaklı evrende rengi değişse dahi kalem kalemdir ve kendi

---

[5] Wisdom kelimesi "akıl", "bilinç" vs anlamına gelebilir fakat şahsi kanaatimce burada "basiret" manası daha uygun olur çünkü "olanaklı dünya'yı" tanrı yaratırken bir sürü dünya yarattı ve onlardan bir tane seçti ki bunu kendi basiretiyle yaptı ve öngördü aksi takdirde en iyisi bu olup olmadığını nereden bilecekti ki.

özünde bir değişim meydana gelmeksizin sadece "renk" niteliğinde bir değişim meydana gelir. Leibniz de Monadlar'ın bir durumdan yek diğer duruma değişme niteliğini sahip olduklarını söyleyerek onu kabiliyet (Appetition) (Leibniz, 1898: 10) kavramıyla açıklamıştır. Monadların bir durumdan diğer duruma geçişini gösterir fakat bunu yaparken de tamamen özünü yitirmezler. Çünkü Monadlar atomlar gibi değildirler. Bölünemezlik, aniden var olma ve aniden yok olma niteliklerine sahiplerdir

Sonuç

Bulunduğumuz Dünya dışında başka Dünya/Dünyalar ve varlığın olması "olanaklı dünyalar" tartışmasına yol açmıştır. Olanaklı evren (possible World) meselesini metinde gördüğümüz gibi Leibniz, Raymond Bradley ve Norman Swartz, Arda Denkel, Robert C.Stalnaker ve Marcus Aurelius isimleri üzerinden tartışılarak çeşitli fikirler öne sürülmüştür. Leibniz, Monadoloji'sinde Monadları töz (substance) olarak belirttiği ve onların aniden var olma "come to being" ya da aniden yok olma "come to an end all at once", farklı özellikleri olma ve Tanrının o sınırsız basiretinden (İnfinite wisdom of God) kaynaklı olarak açıklamıştır. Leibniz'e göre Tanrı iyidir ve sırf iyi olduğu için kötülük yapmaz. O nedenle olanaklı evrenleri yaratmış, fakat bizim içinde bulunduğumuz evreni iyi evren, seçilmiş evren olarak seçmiştir. Raymond Bradley ve Norman Swartz da bundan gerçek Dünya (actual World) olarak söz etmiştir. Fakat kötülüğün olup olmaması konusunda da, Aurelius'un "Tanrı neden sana zarar versin ki" kabulü; Tanrı büyük zararı önlemek için küçük zararın varlığına rıza gösterebilir şeklinde açıklanabilir. Fakat diğer yandan Arda Denkel, Leibniz'in olanaklı Dünya'sını kabul etmekle birlikte "özdeşlik" konusuna bir eleştiri ileri sunmuştur. Olanaklı Dünya'da ve özellikle özdeşlik konusunda zaman-mekan meselesini nasıl açıklandığını ve bu Dünya'daki aynı cismin, olanaklı Dünya'da aynı zaman ve mekanda nasıl özdeş olabildiğini ileri sürmüştür. Olanaklı olabilmesi için (A) özelliği taşıyan (B) cisminin olanaklı Dünya'da da aynı zamanda ve aynı mekanda bulunması şarttır fakat bu pek olası görünmemekte, olanaksız (ex haypothesis) bir olgu olarak ortaya çıkmaktadır.

Kaynakça

- Aurelius, Marcus, *Kendime düşünceler*. Irmak Kaleli (çev.) Zeplin bir Aylak Adam Kültür Sanat Yayıncılık Tic.Ltd. Şti. 1.Baskı, İstanbul

- Cevizci, Ahmet, *17. Yüzyıl Felsefesi*. Say yayınevleri. 4.Baskı

- *Liebniz Monadology*. Aziz YARDIMLI (çev.). İdea yayınevi. İstanbul, 2011

- Denkel ,Arda, *Nesne ve Doğası*. Metis Yayınları. İstanbul

- Bradley, R., & Swartz, N., *Possible world, an introduction to logic and its philosophy*. Departmen of philosophy of Simon Fraser university; Hackett Publishing Company.

- C.Stalnaker, R., *Nous-Possible worlds.*Black Publisher. 2012

ULUSLARARASI
ÖĞRENCİ
SEMPOZYUMU
International Student Symposium

23-25
EYLÜL
KAHRAMANMARAŞ
SÜTÇÜ İMAM ÜNİVERSİTESİ

20
22